

1
00:00:01,397 --> 00:00:04,870
(audience applauds)

2
00:00:04,870 --> 00:00:07,725
- So thank you for that
very kind introduction.

3
00:00:07,725 --> 00:00:10,620
We've been asked to speak
for five to seven minutes,

4
00:00:10,620 --> 00:00:11,770
and then I think we're gonna open it up,

5
00:00:11,770 --> 00:00:14,020
for hopefully a fruitful conversation.

6
00:00:14,020 --> 00:00:15,290
I wanted to set the context,

7
00:00:15,290 --> 00:00:17,310
because the course that
I'm gonna be talking about,

8
00:00:17,310 --> 00:00:19,330
or that I use these strategies on,

9
00:00:19,330 --> 00:00:21,910
is an Ed Policy course,
which is an AC course,

10
00:00:21,910 --> 00:00:25,160
and so, it tends to bring in Ed minors,

11
00:00:25,160 --> 00:00:27,010
but then also people for
whom this is the only time

12
00:00:27,010 --> 00:00:30,980
they're ever gonna talk about
issues of race and inequality.

13
00:00:30,980 --> 00:00:33,760
And the course looks
historically at the establishment

14
00:00:33,760 --> 00:00:35,730
of the educational system,
and then tries to link that

15
00:00:35,730 --> 00:00:37,470
to current reform efforts,

16
00:00:37,470 --> 00:00:40,540
and why the ways we
construct groups historically

17
00:00:40,540 --> 00:00:42,030
is still present today.

18
00:00:42,030 --> 00:00:44,170
And I say that, because
I think the context of,

19
00:00:44,170 --> 00:00:46,100
and the content of the
course really does matter.

20
00:00:46,100 --> 00:00:49,350
And so, I'm not going to
claim I have the answers

21
00:00:49,350 --> 00:00:50,560
to any of this, I'm just gonna tell you

22
00:00:50,560 --> 00:00:53,445
how I muddled through best I can.

23
00:00:53,445 --> 00:00:55,130
But, you know, really thinking about

24
00:00:55,130 --> 00:00:57,210
how your course material
then kinds of brings

25

00:00:57,210 --> 00:00:58,460
a certain kind of students, and then,

26

00:00:58,460 --> 00:01:00,710
what their expectations are of the space.

27

00:01:00,710 --> 00:01:04,240
And I think the key
issue for me, is really,

28

00:01:04,240 --> 00:01:06,280
how do you construct
the space, and realizing

29

00:01:06,280 --> 00:01:08,810
you have to take a lot of
time, and be very deliberate

30

00:01:08,810 --> 00:01:09,840
about constructing the space.

31

00:01:09,840 --> 00:01:11,620
And then, it's an ongoing process

32

00:01:11,620 --> 00:01:12,930
over the course of the semester.

33

00:01:12,930 --> 00:01:14,640
It's not something you
start at the beginning

34

00:01:14,640 --> 00:01:16,910
and are done with, and that
I think that the professor

35

00:01:16,910 --> 00:01:18,730
really does set the tone.

36

00:01:18,730 --> 00:01:22,318
And what I try to do, is
actually talk about my own,

37
00:01:22,318 --> 00:01:24,430
be vulnerable in front of the students,

38
00:01:24,430 --> 00:01:27,760
and talk about what I bring to the class,

39
00:01:27,760 --> 00:01:29,500
why I'm teaching the class.

40
00:01:29,500 --> 00:01:32,460
Make clear that there is no
such thing as objectivity,

41
00:01:32,460 --> 00:01:35,370
or a right answer, that the
issues we're grappling with

42
00:01:35,370 --> 00:01:38,410
are actually quite complex,
and that what you're...

43
00:01:38,410 --> 00:01:40,809
I feel like my goal is to teach them

44
00:01:40,809 --> 00:01:43,470
how to work through their own biases,

45
00:01:43,470 --> 00:01:46,437
and their own processes through the class.

46
00:01:46,437 --> 00:01:48,410
And so, I'm not only teaching
them the course material,

47
00:01:48,410 --> 00:01:51,370
but I'm really teaching them
how to be active thinkers,

48
00:01:51,370 --> 00:01:56,370
and consumers of information,
relevant to politics.

49

00:01:56,440 --> 00:01:58,390

And so, you know, making clear to them

50

00:01:58,390 --> 00:02:01,550

that my point of view is actually
embedded in the syllabus,

51

00:02:01,550 --> 00:02:03,890

right, and that we're
not, we shouldn't act

52

00:02:03,890 --> 00:02:06,120

as if that's not true, and that in fact,

53

00:02:06,120 --> 00:02:07,630

there are things I don't know.

54

00:02:07,630 --> 00:02:09,840

And I have to say, that now that I have

55

00:02:09,840 --> 00:02:10,810

a little bit of gray in my hair,

56

00:02:10,810 --> 00:02:11,770

and have been doing this for awhile,

57

00:02:11,770 --> 00:02:14,160

I'm much more comfortable
saying that, than I was,

58

00:02:14,160 --> 00:02:16,293

like my biggest care when
I started teaching was

59

00:02:16,293 --> 00:02:18,200

how does somebody ask I didn't know.

60

00:02:18,200 --> 00:02:19,880

So I do appreciate that
you're position, you know,

61
00:02:19,880 --> 00:02:22,070
where you are in your
career affects the degree

62
00:02:22,070 --> 00:02:23,220
of vulnerability you can have.

63
00:02:23,220 --> 00:02:26,750
But I think that it makes
students feel better,

64
00:02:26,750 --> 00:02:28,520
for me to say, so the last
time I taught this course

65
00:02:28,520 --> 00:02:30,810
was right when the Trump
Administration took over

66
00:02:30,810 --> 00:02:35,810
in Spring of 2017, and
Betsy Devos had just become

67
00:02:36,020 --> 00:02:38,810
Secretary of Education, and
there, in the news every,

68
00:02:38,810 --> 00:02:40,650
literally every day,
there was something new

69
00:02:40,650 --> 00:02:41,820
about what she was changing.

70
00:02:41,820 --> 00:02:43,870
And so, they would ask,
well, what can she do

71
00:02:43,870 --> 00:02:44,800
to community colleges?

72
00:02:44,800 --> 00:02:47,260

And I could say, I don't
know, let's find out.

73

00:02:47,260 --> 00:02:49,280
And so, the next class,
if people ask you things

74

00:02:49,280 --> 00:02:51,050
you don't know, and you
say you're gonna find out,

75

00:02:51,050 --> 00:02:52,410
you bring the information
the information back.

76

00:02:52,410 --> 00:02:54,730
And I think that helps to
build that sense of trust,

77

00:02:54,730 --> 00:02:57,320
and that we're working
through these things together.

78

00:02:57,320 --> 00:02:59,200
Similarly, I've worked in Congress,

79

00:02:59,200 --> 00:03:00,910
and I talk a lot about
Congress in the class.

80

00:03:00,910 --> 00:03:03,050
And I had to say,
basically, everything I know

81

00:03:03,050 --> 00:03:05,300
about how Congress works,
no longer seems valid.

82

00:03:05,300 --> 00:03:07,240
So let's think about, I don't know,

83

00:03:07,240 --> 00:03:08,590
how is this gonna work out?

84

00:03:08,590 --> 00:03:12,550

And I do think that idea
that there isn't sort of

85

00:03:12,550 --> 00:03:15,263

a perfect answer, I think
is important to producing

86

00:03:15,263 --> 00:03:18,890

the kind of space where you
can have these conversations.

87

00:03:18,890 --> 00:03:21,430

And so, what we do, is
we use what are called

88

00:03:21,430 --> 00:03:22,790

community agreements, which is something

89

00:03:22,790 --> 00:03:24,370

that community organizations do,

90

00:03:24,370 --> 00:03:26,790

but you set out a set
of kind of principles,

91

00:03:26,790 --> 00:03:28,409

of how we're gonna engage in conversation.

92

00:03:28,409 --> 00:03:30,530

Some standard ones are, you know,

93

00:03:30,530 --> 00:03:32,700

take space, make space, the idea that if

94

00:03:32,700 --> 00:03:34,180

you're sort of cognizant of how much space

95

00:03:34,180 --> 00:03:36,640

you're taking up, and so
if you're talking too much,

96

00:03:36,640 --> 00:03:38,090
step, you know, kind of pull back.

97

00:03:38,090 --> 00:03:40,150
And also, to be able to own the space,

98

00:03:40,150 --> 00:03:42,121
for people who aren't comfortable.

99

00:03:42,121 --> 00:03:42,954
And this is a very large
class, so it's important

100

00:03:42,954 --> 00:03:45,200
to make people feel comfortable engaging.

101

00:03:45,200 --> 00:03:47,116
But I think, also the expectation that

102

00:03:47,116 --> 00:03:49,532
the course is going to produce discomfort.

103

00:03:49,532 --> 00:03:52,280
I think we have this idea, that somehow

104

00:03:52,280 --> 00:03:55,680
grappling with hard issues
shouldn't actually make you

105

00:03:55,680 --> 00:03:57,954
feel bad, or weird, or sad,

106

00:03:57,954 --> 00:04:00,270
or shouldn't elicit any kind of emotion.

107

00:04:00,270 --> 00:04:02,020
And I think that setting the expectation,

108

00:04:02,020 --> 00:04:03,560
that in fact, finding out information

109

00:04:03,560 --> 00:04:05,608

that may run contrary
to your idea about how

110

00:04:05,608 --> 00:04:07,430

the United States has worked historically,

111

00:04:07,430 --> 00:04:11,260

may actually make you emotionally unhappy,

112

00:04:11,260 --> 00:04:12,320

and that that's okay.

113

00:04:12,320 --> 00:04:14,123

And so, I think we tend
to talk about civility

114

00:04:14,123 --> 00:04:17,080

as this idea that everyone
should feel perfectly fine,

115

00:04:17,080 --> 00:04:18,960

and have equilibrium all the time.

116

00:04:18,960 --> 00:04:20,831

But, in fact, if you're really
actually working through

117

00:04:20,831 --> 00:04:23,740

some complicated issues,
you should, in fact,

118

00:04:23,740 --> 00:04:26,100

feel uncomfortable, and that
that is, in fact, the point.

119

00:04:26,100 --> 00:04:27,910

And then you can talk through how do you

120

00:04:27,910 --> 00:04:29,440

kind of work through

that discomfort, right?

121

00:04:29,440 --> 00:04:31,030

But I think talking about
productive discomfort

122

00:04:31,030 --> 00:04:32,960

is really useful.

123

00:04:32,960 --> 00:04:35,740

And then, I have a couple
of non-negotiables,

124

00:04:35,740 --> 00:04:38,440

in the sense, that
evidence really matters.

125

00:04:38,440 --> 00:04:40,699

And so, like I was saying when
I say I don't know something,

126

00:04:40,699 --> 00:04:42,614

I will bring my answer, but I will show

127

00:04:42,614 --> 00:04:45,400

where I got that answer, what evidence,

128

00:04:45,400 --> 00:04:47,100

what empirical foundation we have.

129

00:04:47,100 --> 00:04:49,960

Because again, the university
has to stand for something,

130

00:04:49,960 --> 00:04:52,169

and I think what the
university has to stand for,

131

00:04:52,169 --> 00:04:56,540

at a minimum, is that we,
in fact, base our arguments

132

00:04:56,540 --> 00:05:01,239
and our opinions on facts, and
that facts do actually exist.

133
00:05:01,239 --> 00:05:03,872
And we can decide when they're real.

134
00:05:03,872 --> 00:05:07,141
And then, I strongly encourage students

135
00:05:07,141 --> 00:05:10,949
to participate, and I say
that evidence is not only,

136
00:05:10,949 --> 00:05:14,420
you know, data from the
Bureau of Labor Statistics,

137
00:05:14,420 --> 00:05:16,140
but it also can be your
personal experiences.

138
00:05:16,140 --> 00:05:17,220
And when you're talking about education,

139
00:05:17,220 --> 00:05:19,370
everybody has personal
experiences, and I think,

140
00:05:19,370 --> 00:05:21,050
also, that saying that knowledge comes

141
00:05:21,050 --> 00:05:23,570
from different places, and
that those things are valid.

142
00:05:23,570 --> 00:05:25,123
But then when we share that knowledge,

143
00:05:25,123 --> 00:05:27,070
or that we share that evidence,

144

00:05:27,070 --> 00:05:28,960
that we never attack
another person, right?

145
00:05:28,960 --> 00:05:31,016
That we appreciate that people
of goodwill can disagree,

146
00:05:31,016 --> 00:05:34,117
but that in order to have a conversation,

147
00:05:34,117 --> 00:05:39,050
it has to be about the issues at hand,

148
00:05:39,050 --> 00:05:41,590
and not about kind of your judgements

149
00:05:41,590 --> 00:05:43,050
about other people's lived experience.

150
00:05:43,050 --> 00:05:46,850
And so, that is sometimes
a difficult line to manage,

151
00:05:46,850 --> 00:05:49,170
but I do try, and this is the part where

152
00:05:49,170 --> 00:05:51,650
you have to continually,

153
00:05:51,650 --> 00:05:53,990
if people make comments, or engage in ways

154
00:05:53,990 --> 00:05:55,200
that you think are inappropriate,

155
00:05:55,200 --> 00:05:57,450
you have to continually
kind of work through,

156
00:05:58,430 --> 00:05:59,263
and talk through why it is,

157

00:05:59,263 --> 00:06:00,920
or why it isn't, so
that the space continues

158

00:06:00,920 --> 00:06:01,960
to feel safe for people.

159

00:06:01,960 --> 00:06:03,709
Because, the fact of the matter is,

160

00:06:03,709 --> 00:06:06,435
folks who are marginal, often are not able

161

00:06:06,435 --> 00:06:10,440
to have their experiences be
visible in our classrooms.

162

00:06:10,440 --> 00:06:12,610
And so, making that possible,

163

00:06:12,610 --> 00:06:14,620
is in fact, an ongoing process.

164

00:06:14,620 --> 00:06:16,333
And the last thing I'll say,

165

00:06:16,333 --> 00:06:17,166
is that it's really important then,

166

00:06:17,166 --> 00:06:18,530
to work with your GSIs,

167

00:06:18,530 --> 00:06:21,527
because many of them have not
had experiences necessarily,

168

00:06:21,527 --> 00:06:23,120
very much in the classroom,

169

00:06:23,120 --> 00:06:26,250

to really talk through how
they construct their spaces,

170

00:06:26,250 --> 00:06:28,380
how they manage their conversations.

171

00:06:28,380 --> 00:06:30,290
And I meet with them every
week to just check-in,

172

00:06:30,290 --> 00:06:31,750
and say like, okay, what's going on,

173

00:06:31,750 --> 00:06:33,810
are there particular issues coming up?

174

00:06:33,810 --> 00:06:37,920
How are the conversations
going, how are students feeling.

175

00:06:37,920 --> 00:06:40,960
So I think if you manage
all of that, hopefully,

176

00:06:40,960 --> 00:06:42,970
what you get at the end,
is not only students

177

00:06:42,970 --> 00:06:45,810
who have the material, but
ideally, have the tools

178

00:06:45,810 --> 00:06:48,730
to be able to be critical
thinkers, and go forward,

179

00:06:48,730 --> 00:06:50,860
and ask questions about
their own assumptions,

180

00:06:50,860 --> 00:06:53,710
as they move through their political life.

181
00:06:53,710 --> 00:06:54,543
Thanks.

182
00:06:57,159 --> 00:06:59,750
- Hi, everybody.

183
00:06:59,750 --> 00:07:02,619
I teach immigration classes, so I teach a

184
00:07:02,619 --> 00:07:06,710
AC class that is about
50 students, which is

185
00:07:06,710 --> 00:07:08,480
Immigration and Global Perspective,

186
00:07:08,480 --> 00:07:10,380
but largely focused on the United States.

187
00:07:10,380 --> 00:07:11,604
But then in conversation,

188
00:07:11,604 --> 00:07:15,320
largely with Western Europe,
or Canada and Australia.

189
00:07:15,320 --> 00:07:18,679
And I also teach small
senior seminars, 190s,

190
00:07:18,679 --> 00:07:21,880
which I've done a number
of different things,

191
00:07:21,880 --> 00:07:23,520
some of them have just
been a standard seminar,

192
00:07:23,520 --> 00:07:25,500
some of them have been
engaged scholarship,

193

00:07:25,500 --> 00:07:28,086
where students have interned
at community organizations.

194

00:07:28,086 --> 00:07:32,404
And I sometimes go in and do
sort of module lectures in

195

00:07:32,404 --> 00:07:36,670
a large class we have in
Sociology, Comparative Societies,

196

00:07:36,670 --> 00:07:37,722
I'm not doing that as much.

197

00:07:37,722 --> 00:07:40,230
I'd go in for like two
to three class sessions,

198

00:07:40,230 --> 00:07:41,800
and do a little module on immigration,

199

00:07:41,800 --> 00:07:43,878
and that would be 200 people.

200

00:07:43,878 --> 00:07:47,870
I think the strategies
transform, obviously,

201

00:07:47,870 --> 00:07:49,770
when you have a small
group, and you can build

202

00:07:49,770 --> 00:07:53,050
a bigger sense of community,
versus the 200 person lecture

203

00:07:53,050 --> 00:07:54,985
where people are hiding,
and you're not entirely sure

204

00:07:54,985 --> 00:07:57,330

what people are doing.

205

00:07:57,330 --> 00:08:01,373

So I'm gonna talk largely
about the 50 person class.

206

00:08:02,320 --> 00:08:04,690

That is the class that
I taught last spring,

207

00:08:04,690 --> 00:08:06,257

and I'll be teaching it again this spring.

208

00:08:06,257 --> 00:08:09,590

And I told Victoria, when she
asked me to be on this panel,

209

00:08:09,590 --> 00:08:12,640

that actually, I haven't
figured any of this out.

210

00:08:12,640 --> 00:08:14,530

And I really,
(audience laughing)

211

00:08:14,530 --> 00:08:17,067

I really do think that things
have fundamentally changed,

212

00:08:17,067 --> 00:08:20,620

with the election of Donald Trump.

213

00:08:20,620 --> 00:08:24,260

And let me talk through why I'm not sure

214

00:08:24,260 --> 00:08:25,960

what I'm doing anymore, because I thought

215

00:08:25,960 --> 00:08:27,447

I'd sort of figure things out before,

216

00:08:27,447 --> 00:08:29,970

and I just don't know anymore.

217

00:08:29,970 --> 00:08:34,752
So pre-2000, November 2016,

218

00:08:34,752 --> 00:08:36,978
what I would do, is I'd
usually start the course

219

00:08:36,978 --> 00:08:40,550
talking about the politics of immigration,

220

00:08:40,550 --> 00:08:44,220
and I'd make a strong case that
the politics of immigration

221

00:08:44,220 --> 00:08:45,570
in the United States,

222

00:08:45,570 --> 00:08:48,440
are a case of what's
called strange bedfellows.

223

00:08:48,440 --> 00:08:51,290
And that, if you look
within the Republican party,

224

00:08:51,290 --> 00:08:54,550
there's been a strong
pro-immigrant economic wing,

225

00:08:54,550 --> 00:08:58,080
and that there's also a
strong socially conservative,

226

00:08:58,080 --> 00:09:02,400
more nativist, or at least
worried about immigration wing,

227

00:09:02,400 --> 00:09:03,910
but that within the Democratic party,

228

00:09:03,910 --> 00:09:06,570
you have a strong economic
protectionist wing,

229

00:09:06,570 --> 00:09:08,850
that has been historically
very anti-immigrant.

230

00:09:08,850 --> 00:09:11,520
And that, also in the Democratic party,

231

00:09:11,520 --> 00:09:13,110
you have the more cosmopolitan types,

232

00:09:13,110 --> 00:09:15,150
who have been very pro-migrant.

233

00:09:15,150 --> 00:09:17,440
I'd give them very specific
pieces of legislation,

234

00:09:17,440 --> 00:09:19,390
I would point out that in 1986,

235

00:09:19,390 --> 00:09:21,800
the last time the US did an amnesty,

236

00:09:21,800 --> 00:09:24,320
which legalized three million people,

237

00:09:24,320 --> 00:09:27,210
the United Farm Workers came
out against the amnesty,

238

00:09:27,210 --> 00:09:30,490
because they very much did not
want to have wages undercut.

239

00:09:30,490 --> 00:09:32,440
And, you know, a lot of
our students would be,

240

00:09:32,440 --> 00:09:36,050
what, the United Farm Workers,
they were against amnesty?

241
00:09:36,050 --> 00:09:37,350
So that, that's kind of surprising.

242
00:09:37,350 --> 00:09:39,810
And then, I point out, too,
that the US Chamber of Commerce

243
00:09:39,810 --> 00:09:41,610
has been pretty vocal about being

244
00:09:41,610 --> 00:09:45,700
in favor of legalization,
from a very business,

245
00:09:45,700 --> 00:09:48,720
sort of free trade, liberal perspective.

246
00:09:48,720 --> 00:09:51,370
And I would start the class
like that, just to say,

247
00:09:51,370 --> 00:09:53,793
we can't use partisan
labels to understand that.

248
00:09:55,040 --> 00:09:57,720
I don't think we can say that quite

249
00:09:57,720 --> 00:10:02,350
as definitively nowadays,
and the internal fights

250
00:10:02,350 --> 00:10:04,160
within the Republican and Democratic party

251
00:10:04,160 --> 00:10:04,993
have really changed.

252

00:10:04,993 --> 00:10:06,916
I mean, the Democrats are much more

253
00:10:06,916 --> 00:10:08,159
all singing the same tune.

254
00:10:08,159 --> 00:10:10,710
The Republicans, clearly,
the social conservatives,

255
00:10:10,710 --> 00:10:12,893
have taken the ascendancy.

256
00:10:13,960 --> 00:10:16,180
I did it last semester,

257
00:10:16,180 --> 00:10:19,423
but I think it rang
hollow to the students,

258
00:10:19,423 --> 00:10:20,960
so it's not doing what I wanted it to do,

259
00:10:20,960 --> 00:10:23,330
which was, you know,
whatever you're politics are,

260
00:10:23,330 --> 00:10:26,060
think a little bit about
how there are tensions

261
00:10:26,060 --> 00:10:29,000
within that politics when
it comes to immigration.

262
00:10:29,000 --> 00:10:31,820
And so, like I said, I'm
really not quite sure

263
00:10:31,820 --> 00:10:34,400
what to do moving forward.

264

00:10:34,400 --> 00:10:37,980
I have invited students
to send to me an email,

265
00:10:37,980 --> 00:10:40,350
if there's something
in the current events,

266
00:10:40,350 --> 00:10:42,716
like if something comes
across their newsfeed,

267
00:10:42,716 --> 00:10:44,588
that if they want more background,

268
00:10:44,588 --> 00:10:46,380
they can email me about it.

269
00:10:46,380 --> 00:10:48,470
And then, I usually take
five to 10 minutes in class,

270
00:10:48,470 --> 00:10:50,600
to give a little bit of background.

271
00:10:50,600 --> 00:10:54,090
And since with migration,
every single week

272
00:10:54,090 --> 00:10:56,230
is bringing something out
of this administration.

273
00:10:56,230 --> 00:10:59,450
And so, I was teaching when DACA was,

274
00:10:59,450 --> 00:11:01,855
I was teaching was DACA
was being litigated,

275
00:11:01,855 --> 00:11:04,500
so a lot of students had
no clue what DACA was.

276

00:11:04,500 --> 00:11:07,217
And so, I gave them a little
primer about what is DACA,

277

00:11:07,217 --> 00:11:09,373
what's the history of it.

278

00:11:09,373 --> 00:11:13,950
Refugee resettlement has
been cut yet lower again,

279

00:11:13,950 --> 00:11:15,830
and so, I would give them
a little slide to show

280

00:11:15,830 --> 00:11:17,410
what the history of
refugee and resettlement

281

00:11:17,410 --> 00:11:18,310
has been in the US,

282

00:11:18,310 --> 00:11:20,549
and sort of show where that number is.

283

00:11:20,549 --> 00:11:23,420
And so, I guess, one way that I've dealt

284

00:11:23,420 --> 00:11:24,253
with current events,

285

00:11:24,253 --> 00:11:26,350
is not necessarily take them on head-on,

286

00:11:26,350 --> 00:11:29,260
but at least try to give
background information,

287

00:11:29,260 --> 00:11:30,360
so that they can place it

288

00:11:30,360 --> 00:11:31,923
in a larger conversation.

289

00:11:32,773 --> 00:11:36,193
The other thing that I've,

290

00:11:36,193 --> 00:11:38,963
I feel has shifted a little bit, is that,

291

00:11:39,810 --> 00:11:42,470
I think that often, but not always,

292

00:11:42,470 --> 00:11:46,160
in conversations around
marginalized populations,

293

00:11:46,160 --> 00:11:49,100
in the social sciences and
even more in the humanities,

294

00:11:49,100 --> 00:11:50,440
epistemologically,

295

00:11:50,440 --> 00:11:54,477
people have tried to challenge

296

00:11:54,477 --> 00:11:58,580
what might be considered a
narrow positivist approach.

297

00:11:58,580 --> 00:12:01,970
Right, so the deconstruction
of categories,

298

00:12:01,970 --> 00:12:03,500
the questioning of whether,

299

00:12:03,500 --> 00:12:06,466
say, statistics gives us all the answers.

300

00:12:06,466 --> 00:12:10,610

The, you know, raising
up of personal experience

301

00:12:10,610 --> 00:12:13,680
as an important data point,
or an important point of view.

302

00:12:13,680 --> 00:12:15,600
And then, obviously, for some people,

303

00:12:15,600 --> 00:12:17,570
that then comes with
theoretical orientations,

304

00:12:17,570 --> 00:12:20,620
in terms of standpoint theory,
or post-modernism, etc.

305

00:12:20,620 --> 00:12:24,110
I've always been, I don't know,
on the more empirical side,

306

00:12:24,110 --> 00:12:25,887
but, I've had conversation about that,

307

00:12:25,887 --> 00:12:27,720
and definitely tried to challenge

308

00:12:27,720 --> 00:12:30,390
a reunification of categories, and such.

309

00:12:30,390 --> 00:12:32,850
Again, I feel like I'm
in a different place now,

310

00:12:32,850 --> 00:12:36,750
because, in the classroom, to the extent

311

00:12:36,750 --> 00:12:38,120
that we're challenging knowledge,

312

00:12:38,120 --> 00:12:39,930

and we're challenging
the taken for granted,

313

00:12:39,930 --> 00:12:40,810
I feel sometimes,

314

00:12:40,810 --> 00:12:43,870
that I'm actually feeding
into this conversation

315

00:12:43,870 --> 00:12:46,220
about fake news, we can't trust anything,

316

00:12:46,220 --> 00:12:47,470
nothing is truth anymore.

317

00:12:47,470 --> 00:12:50,180
So there's this weird, there's this weird

318

00:12:51,700 --> 00:12:55,440
change, whereas previously,
I think people who have been

319

00:12:55,440 --> 00:12:58,320
advocating for more marginalized
populations, have said,

320

00:12:58,320 --> 00:13:00,610
let's challenge our taken
for granted knowledge,

321

00:13:00,610 --> 00:13:03,210
and now, it feels like
it's really changed,

322

00:13:03,210 --> 00:13:05,220
where it's like, nothing's
true anymore, and therefore,

323

00:13:05,220 --> 00:13:07,868
my nativist, populist, racist

324

00:13:07,868 --> 00:13:11,550
viewpoint is just as
valid as everybody else's.

325
00:13:11,550 --> 00:13:14,420
And so, I'm really hitting even harder

326
00:13:14,420 --> 00:13:17,560
than I probably did before, on facts,

327
00:13:17,560 --> 00:13:21,470
on how do we collect data, what
does the university give us,

328
00:13:21,470 --> 00:13:24,683
what is a research methodology?

329
00:13:25,561 --> 00:13:28,150
And can, you know, maybe
everybody has their point of view,

330
00:13:28,150 --> 00:13:30,040
but can we say that certain points of view

331
00:13:30,040 --> 00:13:33,000
might be buttressed by
more other points of view,

332
00:13:33,000 --> 00:13:34,465
or other empirical evidence,

333
00:13:34,465 --> 00:13:38,140
versus everyone is allowed
their own personal opinion?

334
00:13:38,140 --> 00:13:41,670
And this feels really strange,
because I'm very sympathetic

335
00:13:41,670 --> 00:13:44,888
to the argument that,
historically, science has

336

00:13:44,888 --> 00:13:48,880
really privileged certain
groups over others.

337

00:13:48,880 --> 00:13:51,180
So in my classes, I put a lot of emphasis

338

00:13:51,180 --> 00:13:56,180
on getting students to have
some basic numeracy skills,

339

00:13:56,390 --> 00:13:59,933
and so they have to go through
immigration statistics,

340

00:14:01,117 --> 00:14:03,690
from the US Citizenship and Immigration.

341

00:14:03,690 --> 00:14:06,990
And they have to do a timeline
over the last 100 years,

342

00:14:06,990 --> 00:14:08,870
of a particular immigrant group, and show

343

00:14:08,870 --> 00:14:11,040
how many people entered
the country, and then,

344

00:14:11,040 --> 00:14:12,750
they have to overlay
that with legislation,

345

00:14:12,750 --> 00:14:15,560
to be able to show that after
the Chinese Exclusion Act,

346

00:14:15,560 --> 00:14:18,774
big surprise, there were way
fewer Chinese who came in.

347

00:14:18,774 --> 00:14:22,230

And interestingly, I didn't
find any of this pretty radical,

348

00:14:22,230 --> 00:14:25,040

I mean that, legislation
can make a difference.

349

00:14:25,040 --> 00:14:26,910

But for many of the students, they found

350

00:14:26,910 --> 00:14:29,980

this really revelatory,
they hadn't really thought

351

00:14:29,980 --> 00:14:31,910

that legislation could make a difference.

352

00:14:31,910 --> 00:14:34,050

And then, when you see
the peaks of those numbers

353

00:14:34,050 --> 00:14:36,520

just go slamming down after

354

00:14:36,520 --> 00:14:39,340

the National Origin Quotas
in 1921-24, they were like,

355

00:14:39,340 --> 00:14:43,323

oh, oh, my gosh, this
politics matters, in a way.

356

00:14:44,280 --> 00:14:46,460

The other thing I do, which
is very much different

357

00:14:46,460 --> 00:14:49,320

from the let's look at the statistics,

358

00:14:49,320 --> 00:14:53,397

is students are taught how to
do an oral history interview.

359
00:14:53,397 --> 00:14:55,650
They all do an oral history interview,

360
00:14:55,650 --> 00:14:57,930
and they have to interview an immigrant,

361
00:14:57,930 --> 00:14:58,770
say somebody who's been

362
00:14:58,770 --> 00:15:00,980
in the country five years, et cetera,

363
00:15:00,980 --> 00:15:02,420
and I tell them that they are allowed

364
00:15:02,420 --> 00:15:04,880
to interview a parent or a family member,

365
00:15:04,880 --> 00:15:06,210
in fact I even encourage it,

366
00:15:06,210 --> 00:15:08,426
because I've had more than
one student come to me

367
00:15:08,426 --> 00:15:12,700
and say I've never had that
conversation with my father,

368
00:15:12,700 --> 00:15:13,780
my grandmother,

369
00:15:13,780 --> 00:15:15,300
my aunt,

370
00:15:15,300 --> 00:15:16,590
because there's never a space

371
00:15:16,590 --> 00:15:18,590
to have this kind of conversation,

372

00:15:18,590 --> 00:15:21,330
and especially for those
people whose parents

373

00:15:21,330 --> 00:15:22,230
or family members have

374

00:15:22,230 --> 00:15:25,170
had extremely difficult
migration experiences,

375

00:15:25,170 --> 00:15:28,340
either they came across the
border without inspections

376

00:15:28,340 --> 00:15:30,403
or they are refugees,

377

00:15:30,403 --> 00:15:35,360
they tried to escape a particular
situation multiple times,

378

00:15:35,360 --> 00:15:38,750
really experienced very
significant hardship,

379

00:15:38,750 --> 00:15:40,140
that's not something people can talk

380

00:15:40,140 --> 00:15:42,390
about very easily in your day-to-day life,

381

00:15:42,390 --> 00:15:44,730
but when the student has this,

382

00:15:44,730 --> 00:15:47,040
my professor told me
that I have to do this,

383

00:15:47,040 --> 00:15:48,120
it gives them cover,

384
00:15:48,120 --> 00:15:49,500
it gives them cover to be able

385
00:15:49,500 --> 00:15:51,890
to have that conversation
with a family member.

386
00:15:51,890 --> 00:15:53,050
For those people who don't come

387
00:15:53,050 --> 00:15:55,520
from immigrant families or don't want to,

388
00:15:55,520 --> 00:15:57,423
then they can interview anybody else,

389
00:15:58,416 --> 00:16:00,060
and more than one student has told me that

390
00:16:00,060 --> 00:16:02,480
that has been an extremely
powerful experience,

391
00:16:02,480 --> 00:16:05,970
because then they are able
to talk about the readings,

392
00:16:05,970 --> 00:16:07,270
which is about why people migrate

393
00:16:07,270 --> 00:16:08,650
what integration is like, et cetera,

394
00:16:08,650 --> 00:16:09,920
and then they put in a conversation

395
00:16:09,920 --> 00:16:13,000
with the person that they've interviewed,

396
00:16:13,000 --> 00:16:15,080
it isn't always revelatory,

397

00:16:15,080 --> 00:16:17,880
sometimes people interview
very privileged migrants,

398

00:16:17,880 --> 00:16:20,650
who tend to have a much
easier time of things,

399

00:16:20,650 --> 00:16:23,410
and so in some cases
it can maybe reinforce

400

00:16:23,410 --> 00:16:26,899
certain stereotypes about immigration,

401

00:16:26,899 --> 00:16:29,300
but I still give them those tools,

402

00:16:29,300 --> 00:16:31,503
and then we talk about what
to be get out of interviews

403

00:16:31,503 --> 00:16:33,170
that we don't get out of these statistics

404

00:16:33,170 --> 00:16:35,633
from administrative
data and back-and-forth.

405

00:16:37,040 --> 00:16:38,380
The only other thing I would add,

406

00:16:38,380 --> 00:16:41,572
is that one thing that
I had never done before

407

00:16:41,572 --> 00:16:43,950
but I did this last spring,

408

00:16:43,950 --> 00:16:46,670
was you'll remember there

was a moment on campus

409

00:16:46,670 --> 00:16:51,670

where people from USCIS were on campus

410

00:16:52,020 --> 00:16:54,650

and they were doing the
global travel things,

411

00:16:54,650 --> 00:16:56,400

that you could not do TSA,

412

00:16:56,400 --> 00:16:59,220

and there was a moment that
there was incredible fear

413

00:16:59,220 --> 00:17:01,130

among some of our immigrant students

414

00:17:01,130 --> 00:17:03,313

about what were they doing on campus,

415

00:17:03,313 --> 00:17:05,880

and at that moment

416

00:17:05,880 --> 00:17:08,310

I decided I had to address
it in the classroom,

417

00:17:08,310 --> 00:17:10,260

and luckily the class had
been going on for a while,

418

00:17:10,260 --> 00:17:11,520

so I think we had built a little

419

00:17:11,520 --> 00:17:12,920

bit of a sense of community,

420

00:17:12,920 --> 00:17:17,550

or at least maybe some
sense of safe space,

421

00:17:17,550 --> 00:17:20,940
and I asked the students
in groups to talk about

422

00:17:20,940 --> 00:17:25,940
what would be our community
or our classroom procedures

423

00:17:26,030 --> 00:17:27,680
if ICE agents showed up at the door,

424

00:17:27,680 --> 00:17:28,513
and I said to them,

425

00:17:28,513 --> 00:17:31,020
I said the chance of this
happening is minuscule,

426

00:17:31,020 --> 00:17:32,230
I don't think it will happen,

427

00:17:32,230 --> 00:17:34,220
but I do think we need this conversation

428

00:17:34,220 --> 00:17:35,740
about what would we do,

429

00:17:35,740 --> 00:17:38,110
and that was very difficult conversation,

430

00:17:38,110 --> 00:17:42,370
I think the students who would
be very worried about that

431

00:17:42,370 --> 00:17:44,580
were very worried about
what other students

432

00:17:44,580 --> 00:17:45,500
were gonna be saying,

433
00:17:45,500 --> 00:17:46,930
and whether a student would say yes

434
00:17:46,930 --> 00:17:49,690
of course we should give my
fellow student to an ICE agent,

435
00:17:49,690 --> 00:17:51,600
I don't think that was a
sense of the classroom,

436
00:17:51,600 --> 00:17:53,260
but I think the fear was real,

437
00:17:53,260 --> 00:17:54,430
and then of course the students

438
00:17:54,430 --> 00:17:55,870
who have very secure legal status,

439
00:17:55,870 --> 00:17:57,280
who were born in the United States,

440
00:17:57,280 --> 00:17:59,380
and don't have those kind of concerns,

441
00:17:59,380 --> 00:18:00,660
they weren't sure what to say since

442
00:18:00,660 --> 00:18:01,690
they didn't want to offend anyone,

443
00:18:01,690 --> 00:18:02,880
they didn't want to scare anyone,

444
00:18:02,880 --> 00:18:04,367
and so it was an awkward conversation,

445
00:18:04,367 --> 00:18:07,010
and so after that I
asked people to email me

446
00:18:07,010 --> 00:18:08,630
their comments, their suggestions,

447
00:18:08,630 --> 00:18:10,240
and I got a fair number of emails,

448
00:18:10,240 --> 00:18:11,840
and then I crafted it altogether,

449
00:18:11,840 --> 00:18:13,370
and I put it into a document,

450
00:18:13,370 --> 00:18:15,760
and I put down what
Chancellor Crist had said,

451
00:18:15,760 --> 00:18:17,550
and I gave the ULCP information,

452
00:18:17,550 --> 00:18:18,760
and I handed it out and they said

453
00:18:18,760 --> 00:18:21,000
this was our document for our class,

454
00:18:21,000 --> 00:18:23,570
allowed one more set of
revisions and comments,

455
00:18:23,570 --> 00:18:25,745
and then we had that
as our class document,

456
00:18:25,745 --> 00:18:28,768
but I'm not sure that I,

457
00:18:28,768 --> 00:18:31,290
I'd love to know how else
I could have done that,

458

00:18:31,290 --> 00:18:33,520
because the conversations,

459

00:18:33,520 --> 00:18:37,510
they felt very difficult,
let's just put it this way,

460

00:18:37,510 --> 00:18:40,345
you know sometimes when a
conversation goes really well,

461

00:18:40,345 --> 00:18:41,178
like oh right, we're rocking it,

462

00:18:41,178 --> 00:18:42,011
it's really good,

463

00:18:42,011 --> 00:18:45,460
that was not happening
during this conversation,

464

00:18:45,460 --> 00:18:46,293
so yeah,

465

00:18:46,293 --> 00:18:47,126
I don't have answers.

466

00:18:47,996 --> 00:18:50,329
(all laugh)

467

00:18:51,584 --> 00:18:55,120
- It seems like it was
a lot of answers yeah,

468

00:18:55,120 --> 00:19:00,120
so I'd go with what my
colleagues have said already,

469

00:19:00,270 --> 00:19:03,250
many of their points touch on my points,

470

00:19:03,250 --> 00:19:06,950

so right now I'm in a little
bit of a flying position,

471

00:19:06,950 --> 00:19:10,040
because I tend to teach
these broad hundred

472

00:19:10,040 --> 00:19:14,320
plus undergraduate courses
that are gateway courses,

473

00:19:14,320 --> 00:19:17,170
I teach sociology and
culture which on the surface

474

00:19:17,170 --> 00:19:21,560
itself is not race or
ethnicity or migration course,

475

00:19:21,560 --> 00:19:26,350
but I do bring a lot of
material on inequality,

476

00:19:26,350 --> 00:19:28,650
for example in this
culture class right now,

477

00:19:28,650 --> 00:19:32,600
we have a module on
assimilation and acculturation,

478

00:19:32,600 --> 00:19:36,130
it's not traditionally the
way this class is taught,

479

00:19:36,130 --> 00:19:37,050
but I'm teaching it,

480

00:19:37,050 --> 00:19:38,583
so that's what I'm doing,

481

00:19:39,550 --> 00:19:41,935
so I do bring this in in these ways,

482

00:19:41,935 --> 00:19:44,250
just the course is an
amazing course right now.

483

00:19:44,250 --> 00:19:47,660
And then I teach a very small graduate

484

00:19:47,660 --> 00:19:49,160
course on race and ethnicity,

485

00:19:49,160 --> 00:19:52,926
so on the one hand I'm grappling
with this very intensely,

486

00:19:52,926 --> 00:19:55,480
at the graduate level
which is a bit different,

487

00:19:55,480 --> 00:19:57,448
and then on the other hand I have

488

00:19:57,448 --> 00:19:59,190
a bit more of a gateway course,

489

00:19:59,190 --> 00:20:01,703
so some of my thoughts
will come out of that.

490

00:20:03,820 --> 00:20:06,080
So we are also teaching at a moment

491

00:20:06,080 --> 00:20:07,713
when things are going on,

492

00:20:08,642 --> 00:20:10,960
so remember teaching this course is,

493

00:20:10,960 --> 00:20:14,850
you know when Michael Brown
was shot in Ferguson, Missouri,

494

00:20:14,850 --> 00:20:18,130

I remember coming to both
these courses that week,

495

00:20:18,130 --> 00:20:21,050

and I remember just sort of thinking

496

00:20:21,050 --> 00:20:24,060

from my graduate course
I couldn't just teach,

497

00:20:24,060 --> 00:20:26,680

I forget what we were reading,

498

00:20:26,680 --> 00:20:29,946

but it was not on violence

499

00:20:29,946 --> 00:20:32,390

and the African-American communities,

500

00:20:32,390 --> 00:20:33,223

about policing,

501

00:20:33,223 --> 00:20:34,490

it wasn't about that,

502

00:20:34,490 --> 00:20:36,180

and I just felt really strongly

503

00:20:36,180 --> 00:20:39,820

that I couldn't just go ahead
with the content at hand,

504

00:20:39,820 --> 00:20:42,410

so I got to the graduate course

505

00:20:42,410 --> 00:20:45,650

and I said this is what we're reading,

506

00:20:45,650 --> 00:20:46,510

this is what we read,

507

00:20:46,510 --> 00:20:49,220
we can have this
conversation or we cannot,

508

00:20:49,220 --> 00:20:52,580
we can have as you all that
are going to be trained

509

00:20:52,580 --> 00:20:54,920
as sociologist and move
on with this content

510

00:20:54,920 --> 00:20:56,260
and do what you do within the world,

511

00:20:56,260 --> 00:20:59,120
whether you become professors
or possibly maybe not,

512

00:20:59,120 --> 00:21:02,510
we can have the conversation
that you want to have,

513

00:21:02,510 --> 00:21:03,380
and we did,

514

00:21:03,380 --> 00:21:04,270
it was pretty great,

515

00:21:04,270 --> 00:21:07,340
it was about what is
the role of sociology,

516

00:21:07,340 --> 00:21:08,860
and thinking about social change,

517

00:21:08,860 --> 00:21:11,150
it was about we read all this stuff

518

00:21:11,150 --> 00:21:12,027
but what do we do with it,

519

00:21:12,027 --> 00:21:16,130
it was about what is the
long game in academia,

520

00:21:16,130 --> 00:21:17,820
and thinking about inequality,

521

00:21:17,820 --> 00:21:19,210
if we write about it now,

522

00:21:19,210 --> 00:21:21,010
if what we are writing
about it gets published

523

00:21:21,010 --> 00:21:22,920
two years later what does that mean,

524

00:21:22,920 --> 00:21:24,190
and I think what was great about that,

525

00:21:24,190 --> 00:21:26,013
as at least for graduate students,

526

00:21:27,590 --> 00:21:28,570
I didn't have the answer,

527

00:21:28,570 --> 00:21:31,390
and I felt as frustrated
as everybody else,

528

00:21:31,390 --> 00:21:33,210
and I felt completely demoralized,

529

00:21:33,210 --> 00:21:35,710
but it just felt like a moment when where

530

00:21:35,710 --> 00:21:38,393
it couldn't come in
and just sort of teach.

531

00:21:39,405 --> 00:21:41,470
It's a very special environment

532
00:21:41,470 --> 00:21:46,470
and much we are all very well prepared,

533
00:21:46,660 --> 00:21:49,265
we've had all this preparation
and all this learning,

534
00:21:49,265 --> 00:21:53,630
and yet the world is going on around us,

535
00:21:53,630 --> 00:21:56,770
so I think every so often
creating those moments,

536
00:21:56,770 --> 00:22:01,770
we eventually did get around
to the subject at hand,

537
00:22:02,310 --> 00:22:04,100
but I think the students appreciated this,

538
00:22:04,100 --> 00:22:05,970
and part because we are human too,

539
00:22:05,970 --> 00:22:08,880
we are human and we are reading
this stuff about inequality,

540
00:22:08,880 --> 00:22:12,243
about the history of the nation,

541
00:22:13,080 --> 00:22:14,300
and it is about theory and it

542
00:22:14,300 --> 00:22:16,870
is about learning and
engagement with these ideas,

543
00:22:16,870 --> 00:22:18,040

but then we have to go home,

544

00:22:18,040 --> 00:22:19,230
and then we turn on the news

545

00:22:19,230 --> 00:22:21,330
and then we have to be
engaged to distance ourselves,

546

00:22:21,330 --> 00:22:23,150
and so I think in that space,

547

00:22:23,150 --> 00:22:25,166
I would say that that
space for graduate students

548

00:22:25,166 --> 00:22:29,790
more easily opens up over drinks at a bar,

549

00:22:29,790 --> 00:22:31,930
or later on if you can create these spaces

550

00:22:31,930 --> 00:22:33,360
at dinner at your home,

551

00:22:33,360 --> 00:22:36,570
I find that every so often I'll have

552

00:22:36,570 --> 00:22:38,197
my last grad class at my home,

553

00:22:38,197 --> 00:22:41,460
and it creates the space for
them to really talk about this,

554

00:22:41,460 --> 00:22:44,840
because as we are learning
to become academics,

555

00:22:44,840 --> 00:22:47,070
as we are learning to become
consumers of knowledge,

556
00:22:47,070 --> 00:22:50,010
we have to learn what role academia

557
00:22:50,010 --> 00:22:51,900
itself is playing in society,

558
00:22:51,900 --> 00:22:54,650
the way it itself is
reproducing inequality

559
00:22:54,650 --> 00:22:57,211
or marginalizing certain ideas,

560
00:22:57,211 --> 00:22:59,250
and I think this is,

561
00:22:59,250 --> 00:23:00,870
if we become too consumed,

562
00:23:00,870 --> 00:23:02,570
which is thinking about

563
00:23:02,570 --> 00:23:04,740
what is that professional trajectory,

564
00:23:04,740 --> 00:23:07,350
we lose this very valuable opportunities

565
00:23:07,350 --> 00:23:11,083
right now to really talk
about where we are going.

566
00:23:12,990 --> 00:23:13,823
That said,

567
00:23:13,823 --> 00:23:15,620
from my undergraduate classes,

568
00:23:15,620 --> 00:23:18,730
because I do often have content,

569

00:23:18,730 --> 00:23:20,590
so I teach another class which
I haven't talked for a while,

570

00:23:20,590 --> 00:23:22,463
but it's called Race and Politics,

571

00:23:24,400 --> 00:23:27,830
but blanket statement for all
of my undergraduate classes

572

00:23:27,830 --> 00:23:30,910
I usually start by the
first or second lecture

573

00:23:30,910 --> 00:23:35,280
with what I call the
critical speaking speech,

574

00:23:35,280 --> 00:23:37,980
and so I allow one lecture to flow

575

00:23:37,980 --> 00:23:40,760
and then we see who raises
their hand or whatnot,

576

00:23:40,760 --> 00:23:44,630
and the second lecture often
start from my own experience

577

00:23:44,630 --> 00:23:46,940
as an undergraduate at Berkeley,

578

00:23:46,940 --> 00:23:50,450
in which I talk to them
and I think the students

579

00:23:50,450 --> 00:23:52,750
really sort of appreciate the fact

580

00:23:52,750 --> 00:23:56,160

that I can speak about their feelings,

581

00:23:56,160 --> 00:23:57,010
because I had them,

582

00:23:57,010 --> 00:23:59,520
so I'll speak about the fact that

583

00:23:59,520 --> 00:24:01,970
when I was an undergrad here at Berkeley,

584

00:24:01,970 --> 00:24:04,560
I was the first of my
family to go to college,

585

00:24:04,560 --> 00:24:06,010
my parents were immigrants,

586

00:24:06,010 --> 00:24:10,866
and how I always felt very
severely this impostor syndrome,

587

00:24:10,866 --> 00:24:12,160
that I was a fraud,

588

00:24:12,160 --> 00:24:15,050
I thought I had gotten in here by mistake,

589

00:24:15,050 --> 00:24:17,110
and that really helped to silence

590

00:24:17,110 --> 00:24:19,510
me throughout a lot of my classes,

591

00:24:19,510 --> 00:24:20,370
I would sit in the back,

592

00:24:20,370 --> 00:24:21,580
I wouldn't really engage,

593

00:24:21,580 --> 00:24:25,780

and it really took a moment of reflection,

594

00:24:25,780 --> 00:24:28,115
and the moment of reflection
wasn't necessarily

595

00:24:28,115 --> 00:24:32,110
a moment of oh yeah I'm really smart,

596

00:24:32,110 --> 00:24:32,943
or oh yeah I know all this,

597

00:24:32,943 --> 00:24:34,043
it wasn't actually that,

598

00:24:34,043 --> 00:24:35,780
what the moment of reflection was about,

599

00:24:35,780 --> 00:24:37,876
was the moment of
reflection of understanding

600

00:24:37,876 --> 00:24:40,260
that inequality and the patterns

601

00:24:40,260 --> 00:24:41,930
across the classes I was taking,

602

00:24:41,930 --> 00:24:46,060
so I sat back I remember by my junior year

603

00:24:46,060 --> 00:24:49,650
and realized the students
of color weren't speaking,

604

00:24:49,650 --> 00:24:54,368
there weren't that many
women raising their hands,

605

00:24:54,368 --> 00:24:57,510
professors always have this Q&A session

606
00:24:57,510 --> 00:24:59,897
but only certain students participate,

607
00:24:59,897 --> 00:25:03,972
so I remember thinking very deeply,

608
00:25:03,972 --> 00:25:06,650
unless I sort of spoke out,

609
00:25:06,650 --> 00:25:07,960
and unless I started becoming

610
00:25:07,960 --> 00:25:10,733
an active participant this would continue.

611
00:25:11,801 --> 00:25:14,950
So I remember by my junior year,

612
00:25:14,950 --> 00:25:19,310
willing and forcing and daring
myself to speak in class,

613
00:25:19,310 --> 00:25:23,300
I remember my stomach would
churn before a lecture,

614
00:25:23,300 --> 00:25:25,350
because I had this personal dare

615
00:25:25,350 --> 00:25:27,910
that was built on the
sense of this is unfair,

616
00:25:27,910 --> 00:25:31,740
we should have a more
inclusive class discussion,

617
00:25:31,740 --> 00:25:35,220
so I laid this entire
story out to students,

618

00:25:35,220 --> 00:25:36,240
I'd tell them,

619
00:25:36,240 --> 00:25:37,940
I'd tell them exactly where I would sit,

620
00:25:37,940 --> 00:25:38,990
and I'd tell them but the end

621
00:25:38,990 --> 00:25:42,260
of the semester following my junior year,

622
00:25:42,260 --> 00:25:45,440
other peers in my class would
come up to me and say hey,

623
00:25:45,440 --> 00:25:48,550
you're the girl that speaks
in class all the time,

624
00:25:48,550 --> 00:25:51,433
and I laid this out to tell
them that here at Berkeley,

625
00:25:52,560 --> 00:25:54,670
we want to foster not only critical

626
00:25:54,670 --> 00:25:56,890
thinking and critical writing,

627
00:25:56,890 --> 00:25:59,970
but we very much want to
foster critical speaking,

628
00:25:59,970 --> 00:26:03,870
and I find that if I show
them the inequalities laid

629
00:26:03,870 --> 00:26:06,680
out that they probably see are now sort

630
00:26:06,680 --> 00:26:10,270

of reflecting on it as
a pattern across campus,

631

00:26:10,270 --> 00:26:12,530
it really helps to open up that space.

632

00:26:12,530 --> 00:26:14,120
And then of course all the tricks

633

00:26:14,120 --> 00:26:18,620
that all of us as educators
use to create those spaces,

634

00:26:18,620 --> 00:26:20,650
it's about the small groups,

635

00:26:20,650 --> 00:26:23,620
semi-discussion or reflection
questions over email,

636

00:26:23,620 --> 00:26:26,450
but I find that actually
just telling them,

637

00:26:26,450 --> 00:26:27,800
I can see you,

638

00:26:27,800 --> 00:26:28,650
I went through this,

639

00:26:28,650 --> 00:26:30,100
I know it's hard,

640

00:26:30,100 --> 00:26:32,130
your stomach is probably hurting,

641

00:26:32,130 --> 00:26:35,910
but just engage with us because
this will be a better class,

642

00:26:35,910 --> 00:26:37,750
we have this one opportunity

643
00:26:37,750 --> 00:26:39,930
to really grapple as a
community with this idea,

644
00:26:39,930 --> 00:26:42,990
so come with me and I will
create that space for you,

645
00:26:42,990 --> 00:26:46,370
I really think that helps a lot.

646
00:26:46,370 --> 00:26:48,180
Like Irene said,

647
00:26:48,180 --> 00:26:53,180
at this moment it's a
really interesting time,

648
00:26:53,500 --> 00:26:56,030
because I'm much more going
back to the facts than

649
00:26:56,030 --> 00:26:57,470
I ever have before,

650
00:26:57,470 --> 00:26:59,770
drawing on census figures,

651
00:26:59,770 --> 00:27:02,813
talking about what net
migration looks like,

652
00:27:05,436 --> 00:27:07,690
is it unprecedented levels,

653
00:27:07,690 --> 00:27:08,760
things of this sort,

654
00:27:08,760 --> 00:27:10,600
and I find myself going back to

655

00:27:10,600 --> 00:27:14,060
the facts and actually
doubling down on more facts,

656

00:27:14,060 --> 00:27:17,622
and here are all the
citations for these facts

657

00:27:17,622 --> 00:27:22,003
in ways that I had probably
had not to that level before,

658

00:27:23,980 --> 00:27:26,140
so I'll just say two more things,

659

00:27:26,140 --> 00:27:29,030
I think teaching right now at this moment,

660

00:27:29,030 --> 00:27:32,490
what has been helpful for me is the arts,

661

00:27:32,490 --> 00:27:36,440
I think bringing in short film clips,

662

00:27:36,440 --> 00:27:38,750
music has helped,

663

00:27:38,750 --> 00:27:40,632
art pieces,

664

00:27:40,632 --> 00:27:42,285
poetry even into the classes,

665

00:27:42,285 --> 00:27:47,270
as expressions of feelings of inequality,

666

00:27:47,270 --> 00:27:49,090
feelings of outsider-ness,

667

00:27:49,090 --> 00:27:52,001
feelings of foreignness

has helped in a way

668

00:27:52,001 --> 00:27:55,890
to open up this basis for discussion,

669

00:27:55,890 --> 00:28:00,369
so for example we have a session on music,

670

00:28:00,369 --> 00:28:03,480
so it's on sociology and culture,

671

00:28:03,480 --> 00:28:05,860
so how music is produced, et cetera,

672

00:28:05,860 --> 00:28:10,730
and I often put in snippets of songs

673

00:28:10,730 --> 00:28:13,810
that are really popular in the
Black Lives Matter movement,

674

00:28:13,810 --> 00:28:16,560
songs by Kendrick Lamar for example,

675

00:28:16,560 --> 00:28:20,214
or even just going back,
Mavis and Mel for example,

676

00:28:20,214 --> 00:28:23,940
and I find that this sort
of allows them to connect

677

00:28:23,940 --> 00:28:27,410
to the lyrics in ways that speaks

678

00:28:27,410 --> 00:28:29,751
to them and to their moment,

679

00:28:29,751 --> 00:28:31,800
and that opens up that
political conversation

680
00:28:31,800 --> 00:28:35,580
in ways that just the dry text reading

681
00:28:35,580 --> 00:28:36,963
doesn't allow for that.

682
00:28:38,709 --> 00:28:40,809
And I think the last thing is that so this

683
00:28:41,907 --> 00:28:44,770
has happened while I've been
teaching at Berkeley now,

684
00:28:44,770 --> 00:28:47,580
I've been here for about seven years now,

685
00:28:47,580 --> 00:28:50,950
and this is why a lot of us
love teaching at Berkeley,

686
00:28:50,950 --> 00:28:53,430
but it happens much more now,

687
00:28:53,430 --> 00:28:57,350
is that our students, or my students often

688
00:28:57,350 --> 00:28:59,610
push me especially in sociology classes

689
00:28:59,610 --> 00:29:03,500
to give them the answer
of now what do we do,

690
00:29:03,500 --> 00:29:05,540
you showed us all these
patterns of inequality,

691
00:29:05,540 --> 00:29:09,230
you have exposed history,
you've done all this,

692

00:29:09,230 --> 00:29:11,363
what do we do to change it?

693
00:29:12,360 --> 00:29:14,950
And I think more than ever right

694
00:29:14,950 --> 00:29:18,370
now even the small little
things are important,

695
00:29:18,370 --> 00:29:20,330
I think students really
want to understand,

696
00:29:20,330 --> 00:29:22,240
so what are the glimmers of hope,

697
00:29:22,240 --> 00:29:24,520
how can we make this better,

698
00:29:24,520 --> 00:29:27,190
how can we push for a much more just

699
00:29:27,190 --> 00:29:30,670
and fair humane set of
immigration policies,

700
00:29:30,670 --> 00:29:33,600
or policies about anything,

701
00:29:33,600 --> 00:29:35,260
policing, et cetera,

702
00:29:35,260 --> 00:29:38,020
and I find myself looking
for that stuff more,

703
00:29:38,020 --> 00:29:40,340
I find that this question is much

704
00:29:40,340 --> 00:29:42,840
more heightened of the what do we do,

705

00:29:42,840 --> 00:29:44,980
so I find myself much more now,

706

00:29:44,980 --> 00:29:49,960
so starting from the facts
and the course content,

707

00:29:49,960 --> 00:29:53,100
thinking about small little
ways in office hours,

708

00:29:53,100 --> 00:29:55,500
or at the end of lectures about,

709

00:29:55,500 --> 00:29:56,770
okay where is the ray of hope,

710

00:29:56,770 --> 00:29:58,420
where is that opening,

711

00:29:58,420 --> 00:29:59,937
I can't always find it,

712

00:29:59,937 --> 00:30:03,363
and I go that's thinking
about this sometimes,

713

00:30:03,363 --> 00:30:06,340
but I find that students are asking

714

00:30:06,340 --> 00:30:07,863
for that even more so now.

715

00:30:09,870 --> 00:30:11,660
- [Victoria] So a lot of food for thought,

716

00:30:11,660 --> 00:30:13,560
I'm wondering it feels like could you

717

00:30:13,560 --> 00:30:14,590

do what we did at the beginning,

718

00:30:14,590 --> 00:30:16,020
turn to each other,

719

00:30:16,020 --> 00:30:18,930
and something comes up
of the comments already

720

00:30:18,930 --> 00:30:21,470
from our panelists that is sitting

721

00:30:21,470 --> 00:30:24,320
in your mind as something you
want to ask further about,

722

00:30:24,320 --> 00:30:26,278
or something that is
just getting generated,

723

00:30:26,278 --> 00:30:28,447
you Wanna take five minutes
to turn to each other

724

00:30:28,447 --> 00:30:30,520
and then reflect on the discussion so far,

725

00:30:30,520 --> 00:30:32,723
and we'll come back to our other lessons.

726

00:30:35,503 --> 00:30:37,460
Okay let's bring some of these questions

727

00:30:37,460 --> 00:30:38,710
through to the panelists.

728

00:30:39,800 --> 00:30:40,740
- [Woman] Good morning,

729

00:30:40,740 --> 00:30:42,700
so my question is,

730
00:30:42,700 --> 00:30:44,260
I'm in the College of Engineering

731
00:30:44,260 --> 00:30:46,110
and I'm trying to understand how

732
00:30:46,110 --> 00:30:48,360
to help faculty implement some

733
00:30:48,360 --> 00:30:51,430
of these strategies in engineering spaces,

734
00:30:51,430 --> 00:30:56,430
where we don't really
have the conversation,

735
00:30:57,838 --> 00:31:01,800
but we are cognizant that
there is implicit bias

736
00:31:01,800 --> 00:31:03,760
and marginalizing all of

737
00:31:03,760 --> 00:31:06,390
that happening throughout the college,

738
00:31:06,390 --> 00:31:08,290
so how do we do that,

739
00:31:08,290 --> 00:31:10,903
is there any suggestion?

740
00:31:15,370 --> 00:31:17,700
- That's a really hard question.

741
00:31:17,700 --> 00:31:20,050
I'm gonna start again with I don't know,

742
00:31:20,050 --> 00:31:24,510
but I would imagine that it would have

743
00:31:24,510 --> 00:31:26,880
to start with having
some conversations among

744
00:31:26,880 --> 00:31:30,420
the faculty about how they
structure their classrooms,

745
00:31:30,420 --> 00:31:31,853
and I realize,

746
00:31:32,920 --> 00:31:34,940
and I know there probably
are a good number

747
00:31:34,940 --> 00:31:38,610
of folks in engineering
who want to do this better,

748
00:31:38,610 --> 00:31:40,280
but perhaps feel like
they don't have the tools,

749
00:31:40,280 --> 00:31:41,700
at least that's my sense
of some of the folks

750
00:31:41,700 --> 00:31:43,280
I know at the college,

751
00:31:43,280 --> 00:31:44,990
so I think start with your allies

752
00:31:44,990 --> 00:31:48,289
and see about providing support to them,

753
00:31:48,289 --> 00:31:50,550
I know with faculty it's really hard

754
00:31:50,550 --> 00:31:52,690
to get folks to have
time to be able to meet,

755
00:31:52,690 --> 00:31:54,000
but if you could have some kind

756
00:31:54,000 --> 00:31:55,900
of constructing working group,

757
00:31:55,900 --> 00:31:58,410
where people talk about
what works and what doesn't,

758
00:31:58,410 --> 00:32:00,880
for exactly the things that
Christina was talking about,

759
00:32:00,880 --> 00:32:03,440
in terms of thinking about how do you make

760
00:32:05,010 --> 00:32:08,080
people's holding of the
space more egalitarian,

761
00:32:08,080 --> 00:32:09,686
and how do you get people to recognize

762
00:32:09,686 --> 00:32:14,520
those inequalities and how you get folks

763
00:32:14,520 --> 00:32:16,300
to appreciate that just the way

764
00:32:16,300 --> 00:32:18,270
they present material really matters,

765
00:32:18,270 --> 00:32:20,580
so for example I was having a conversation

766
00:32:20,580 --> 00:32:21,620
with Bob Bourgenot,

767
00:32:21,620 --> 00:32:24,840

and he said when he was
at MIT he made a concerted

768
00:32:24,840 --> 00:32:26,870
effort to talk about female physicists,

769
00:32:26,870 --> 00:32:29,858
to talk about female physicists,

770
00:32:29,858 --> 00:32:32,446
to just bring up stories,

771
00:32:32,446 --> 00:32:34,490
than that how you frame even

772
00:32:34,490 --> 00:32:37,170
the production of scientific
knowledge really matters,

773
00:32:37,170 --> 00:32:39,920
and that small changes like
that of who you talk about,

774
00:32:42,309 --> 00:32:44,450
when you talk about a particular concept

775
00:32:44,450 --> 00:32:46,120
that you mention hey there were women

776
00:32:46,120 --> 00:32:48,070
that were actually part
of creating this thing,

777
00:32:48,070 --> 00:32:50,180
which usually isn't part
of the conversation,

778
00:32:50,180 --> 00:32:51,350
that he found that really kind

779
00:32:51,350 --> 00:32:53,320
of changed the feel of the classroom,

780

00:32:53,320 --> 00:32:54,860
at least in his perception,

781

00:32:54,860 --> 00:32:56,700
and so I think appreciating
that small things,

782

00:32:56,700 --> 00:32:59,319
and just thinking about why
do I talk about it this way,

783

00:32:59,319 --> 00:33:01,960
are there other ways to bring other voices

784

00:33:01,960 --> 00:33:05,380
in that would reframe
how people see science,

785

00:33:05,380 --> 00:33:06,350
because you tend to see science

786

00:33:06,350 --> 00:33:09,850
as this objective rarefied thing,

787

00:33:09,850 --> 00:33:12,290
but rather than appreciate
that how we talk about science,

788

00:33:12,290 --> 00:33:13,660
how we talk about scientific discovery,

789

00:33:13,660 --> 00:33:15,510
actually all these biases are embedded,

790

00:33:15,510 --> 00:33:18,230
so I would start with a small group

791

00:33:18,230 --> 00:33:21,713
of interested faculty
and see if you can build

792
00:33:21,713 --> 00:33:24,950
a toolkit that then can be talked

793
00:33:24,950 --> 00:33:27,130
about and adopted by a broader set,

794
00:33:27,130 --> 00:33:28,300
and I bet there are lots of faculty

795
00:33:28,300 --> 00:33:29,990
in engineering who are already doing this,

796
00:33:29,990 --> 00:33:31,800
I'm not gonna act like nobody is,

797
00:33:31,800 --> 00:33:33,360
so how do you build up what's there,

798
00:33:33,360 --> 00:33:36,280
and I think you make it easy for faculty,

799
00:33:36,280 --> 00:33:38,360
because often teaching, we're tired,

800
00:33:38,360 --> 00:33:40,010
we don't have the time we like,

801
00:33:40,010 --> 00:33:41,910
you don't know where to
find the information,

802
00:33:41,910 --> 00:33:44,053
I think the easier you can make it,

803
00:33:45,260 --> 00:33:48,953
the more likely it is
you'll have people adopt.

804
00:33:51,420 --> 00:33:54,040
- These are two suggestions,

805
00:33:54,040 --> 00:33:57,580
I agree with Christina's
comment about critical speaking,

806
00:33:57,580 --> 00:33:59,660
and one way to do that
in a space where people

807
00:33:59,660 --> 00:34:01,610
may not be ready to think structurally

808
00:34:01,610 --> 00:34:04,910
about why certain groups
do and do not speak,

809
00:34:04,910 --> 00:34:08,570
is just to ask the students
to break into groups

810
00:34:08,570 --> 00:34:10,480
of people who are more
extroverted and like

811
00:34:10,480 --> 00:34:12,170
to talk in classrooms and people

812
00:34:12,170 --> 00:34:15,190
who are more introverted and would prefer

813
00:34:15,190 --> 00:34:17,270
to think through it and
not talk in classrooms,

814
00:34:17,270 --> 00:34:19,870
and so you break those
into two different groups

815
00:34:19,870 --> 00:34:21,500
and so discussion
sections would be easiest,

816
00:34:21,500 --> 00:34:23,520

but maybe you can even do it in a lecture,

817

00:34:23,520 --> 00:34:25,260

and then you have each of those groups

818

00:34:25,260 --> 00:34:29,633

talk about why they speak
or why they don't speak,

819

00:34:31,620 --> 00:34:32,840

what could be done to make sure

820

00:34:32,840 --> 00:34:34,880

that everyone has a chance to speak,

821

00:34:34,880 --> 00:34:36,610

and then you go back and you have

822

00:34:36,610 --> 00:34:38,400

the groups report back to each other,

823

00:34:38,400 --> 00:34:42,297

and I think the people who
tend not to speak as much,

824

00:34:42,297 --> 00:34:44,010

will appreciate,

825

00:34:44,010 --> 00:34:45,310

often the extroverts will say,

826

00:34:45,310 --> 00:34:46,960

but we really want everyone to speak,

827

00:34:46,960 --> 00:34:50,120

we don't understand why they
don't just talk like us,

828

00:34:50,120 --> 00:34:53,730

but hearing that they
do actually want to hear

829

00:34:53,730 --> 00:34:55,760
from other people I think
can sometimes be good,

830

00:34:55,760 --> 00:34:57,441
and then there's the conversation

831

00:34:57,441 --> 00:35:00,260
about what can be the
classroom expectations,

832

00:35:00,260 --> 00:35:03,350
and you don't do it based
on things like gender

833

00:35:03,350 --> 00:35:05,150
or race or economic background

834

00:35:05,150 --> 00:35:07,397
or something might be part of that,

835

00:35:07,397 --> 00:35:08,410
and I think that's an
important conversation

836

00:35:08,410 --> 00:35:09,900
to have which you can maybe have later,

837

00:35:09,900 --> 00:35:11,320
but you just start with the introverts

838

00:35:11,320 --> 00:35:14,040
and extroverts and open that space.

839

00:35:14,040 --> 00:35:15,940
The other thing potentially to talk about,

840

00:35:15,940 --> 00:35:17,750
and this I learned from Victoria

841

00:35:17,750 --> 00:35:19,790

and people at the ACES program,

842

00:35:19,790 --> 00:35:23,901
so the American Cultures
Engaged Scholarship program,

843

00:35:23,901 --> 00:35:27,950
is really lifting up
knowledge from other sources,

844

00:35:27,950 --> 00:35:30,640
so this is about the epistemology,

845

00:35:30,640 --> 00:35:33,020
and so an engineering I
wondered if it be interesting

846

00:35:33,020 --> 00:35:35,560
to share with faculty
or have faculty think

847

00:35:35,560 --> 00:35:37,770
about case studies where engineers

848

00:35:37,770 --> 00:35:39,190
thought they had the answer,

849

00:35:39,190 --> 00:35:41,900
and then with the application
it didn't quite work,

850

00:35:41,900 --> 00:35:42,920
because they just didn't have

851

00:35:42,920 --> 00:35:44,570
the local knowledge on the ground,

852

00:35:44,570 --> 00:35:46,130
and so I think,

853

00:35:46,130 --> 00:35:47,410
because then you could raise up

854
00:35:47,410 --> 00:35:49,580
the fact that people have local knowledge,

855
00:35:49,580 --> 00:35:51,230
and regardless of their background,

856
00:35:51,230 --> 00:35:52,904
even if they never finished high school

857
00:35:52,904 --> 00:35:55,540
they know something and
we gotta listen to them,

858
00:35:55,540 --> 00:35:59,010
and so I think that helps
also de-center this idea,

859
00:35:59,010 --> 00:36:01,370
that just because you can do fancy math,

860
00:36:01,370 --> 00:36:02,923
you're special.

861
00:36:07,083 --> 00:36:08,150
- And I think one part of it

862
00:36:08,150 --> 00:36:10,560
is definitely engaging
the graduate students,

863
00:36:10,560 --> 00:36:12,930
the graduate student
discussion section leaders,

864
00:36:12,930 --> 00:36:16,970
because I know one dynamic
is the broad classroom,

865
00:36:16,970 --> 00:36:18,880
but there are also serious dynamics

866

00:36:18,880 --> 00:36:20,980
that happen in the smaller
discussion sections,

867

00:36:20,980 --> 00:36:24,350
so having them more
cognizant of these patterns

868

00:36:24,350 --> 00:36:26,540
that's a much more open conversation

869

00:36:26,540 --> 00:36:28,210
that you can have there,

870

00:36:28,210 --> 00:36:29,755
and the second thing I'm thinking about,

871

00:36:29,755 --> 00:36:31,683
aside from what everyone said,

872

00:36:32,562 --> 00:36:35,093
what's super useful is,

873

00:36:37,410 --> 00:36:41,650
what's super useful to me is
the mid-semester evaluation,

874

00:36:41,650 --> 00:36:46,600
where I sort of said what's
going right what's going wrong,

875

00:36:46,600 --> 00:36:50,280
and then one part is I can
imagine just a broad question,

876

00:36:50,280 --> 00:36:51,630
what would make this feel more like

877

00:36:51,630 --> 00:36:53,143
an inclusive space for you,

878

00:36:54,178 --> 00:36:55,050
and just have it open,

879
00:36:55,050 --> 00:36:58,350
so students can say
this is how I'm feeling,

880
00:36:58,350 --> 00:36:59,320
or this is what's going on,

881
00:36:59,320 --> 00:37:02,060
there's something about
just knowing that pulse,

882
00:37:02,060 --> 00:37:05,070
so when I have the what's
going what, what's going wrong,

883
00:37:05,070 --> 00:37:07,793
sometimes the what's
going wrong is it says

884
00:37:07,793 --> 00:37:11,440
not enough people are
participating in discussion,

885
00:37:11,440 --> 00:37:13,580
so then I can use that as an excuse,

886
00:37:13,580 --> 00:37:16,260
I started the class with like look all

887
00:37:16,260 --> 00:37:19,380
of you said that you want to
hear more from each other,

888
00:37:19,380 --> 00:37:23,731
so quite a bit of that is only
to make you more comfortable,

889
00:37:23,731 --> 00:37:24,840
but part of that is on you too,

890

00:37:24,840 --> 00:37:26,560
so let's be engaged here too,

891

00:37:26,560 --> 00:37:29,640
but I think that the
evaluation in mid-semester,

892

00:37:29,640 --> 00:37:30,580
it's super easy,

893

00:37:30,580 --> 00:37:32,860
it goes through really quickly,

894

00:37:32,860 --> 00:37:36,053
can provide that sort
of crutch or opportunity

895

00:37:36,053 --> 00:37:39,883
to have that conversation too.

896

00:37:42,500 --> 00:37:44,050
- [Robert] Thank you very much,

897

00:37:45,030 --> 00:37:47,200
I'm Robert Stern, I'm
at the business school

898

00:37:47,200 --> 00:37:48,730
and I just want to say thank you so much

899

00:37:48,730 --> 00:37:51,053
for the conversation
for constructing this,

900

00:37:52,332 --> 00:37:57,332
and I've heard the theme of
going to the empirical evidence,

901

00:37:57,440 --> 00:37:58,862
over and over again,

902

00:37:58,862 --> 00:38:00,880
and I appreciate that,

903
00:38:00,880 --> 00:38:02,620
and I happen to teach,

904
00:38:02,620 --> 00:38:04,300
I'm very interested in the Nordic region

905
00:38:04,300 --> 00:38:05,500
and what we can learn and how

906
00:38:05,500 --> 00:38:08,940
they approach capitalism
and sustainability,

907
00:38:08,940 --> 00:38:11,910
and historically I could
just put the evidence there,

908
00:38:11,910 --> 00:38:12,970
and say look,

909
00:38:12,970 --> 00:38:13,870
one, two, three, four, five,

910
00:38:13,870 --> 00:38:16,110
the Nordic region is always outperforming

911
00:38:16,110 --> 00:38:17,940
when it comes to climate change policy,

912
00:38:17,940 --> 00:38:20,700
or when it comes to any other

913
00:38:20,700 --> 00:38:22,653
kind of measure of sustainability,

914
00:38:23,620 --> 00:38:26,690
and I have been in the last
two years kind of blind-sided,

915
00:38:26,690 --> 00:38:29,020
because I've relied upon that,

916
00:38:29,020 --> 00:38:32,203
but the Nordic agenda has
been teed up as being,

917
00:38:33,617 --> 00:38:35,151
far right wing elements will say

918
00:38:35,151 --> 00:38:36,110
that the Nordics are communists,

919
00:38:36,110 --> 00:38:40,010
and this tees up a very political agenda

920
00:38:40,010 --> 00:38:43,820
of the Nordic region that I
hadn't necessarily intended,

921
00:38:43,820 --> 00:38:46,320
so now this last time I taught a class,

922
00:38:46,320 --> 00:38:48,770
it was a required class,

923
00:38:48,770 --> 00:38:51,370
which means that there is
a different distribution,

924
00:38:51,370 --> 00:38:54,160
and folks came over there
and all the empiricals

925
00:38:54,160 --> 00:38:56,060
that I could pick up to demonstrate

926
00:38:56,060 --> 00:38:58,560
this region of the
world is doing very well

927

00:38:58,560 --> 00:39:01,790
from a sustainability
perspective was effectively

928
00:39:01,790 --> 00:39:05,300
being seen as he's promoting
a left-wing agenda,

929
00:39:05,300 --> 00:39:10,300
and I find myself struggling
to say how do I actually,

930
00:39:10,382 --> 00:39:12,785
in the face of here's the empirical,

931
00:39:12,785 --> 00:39:16,530
and it's just all seen
as a political agenda,

932
00:39:16,530 --> 00:39:18,160
and what do I do about that,

933
00:39:18,160 --> 00:39:20,073
because I do have a point of view,

934
00:39:20,073 --> 00:39:22,930
and I happen to think that there
is something to be learned,

935
00:39:22,930 --> 00:39:25,540
but the whole thing was
almost dismissed out of hand,

936
00:39:25,540 --> 00:39:27,690
because this is a whole political agenda,

937
00:39:27,690 --> 00:39:30,650
and I would imagine that
you're in more contentious

938
00:39:30,650 --> 00:39:33,370
areas than I am in the
sustainability agenda,

939

00:39:33,370 --> 00:39:35,043

I don't know how to deal with that.

940

00:39:37,296 --> 00:39:38,530

- So when you open the class,

941

00:39:38,530 --> 00:39:42,870

do you layout your
normative positionality,

942

00:39:42,870 --> 00:39:45,990

in the sense of saying I
think climate change is real,

943

00:39:45,990 --> 00:39:47,930

I think sustainability is a good thing,

944

00:39:47,930 --> 00:39:49,380

here are all the reasons why,

945

00:39:50,490 --> 00:39:51,690

do you frame it in that?

946

00:39:52,950 --> 00:39:54,400

- [Robert] Effectively that's the ideal,

947

00:39:54,400 --> 00:39:58,270

I would start by saying
here all the indicators

948

00:39:58,270 --> 00:40:01,053

by every measure of sustainability,

949

00:40:02,640 --> 00:40:04,690

looking at why this particular cluster

950

00:40:04,690 --> 00:40:06,940

is actually outperforming
the rest of the world,

951

00:40:06,940 --> 00:40:08,050
and implicit in there,

952

00:40:08,050 --> 00:40:10,690
is when you are outperforming
in climate change

953

00:40:10,690 --> 00:40:12,460
I believe that that is an important

954

00:40:12,460 --> 00:40:14,163
thing and that is a real thing.

955

00:40:15,058 --> 00:40:16,269
- So I wonder if it wouldn't be,

956

00:40:16,269 --> 00:40:17,102
because I open my class by saying

957

00:40:17,102 --> 00:40:19,330
I think educational inequality is bad,

958

00:40:19,330 --> 00:40:20,620
and I'm willing to say,

959

00:40:20,620 --> 00:40:22,790
I think the idea that
we can't take positions,

960

00:40:22,790 --> 00:40:25,780
or somehow the goal is to have both

961

00:40:25,780 --> 00:40:27,920
sides are equal in there,

962

00:40:27,920 --> 00:40:30,220
it creates false equivalency,

963

00:40:30,220 --> 00:40:34,430
we have to have the ability
to claim a normative goal,

964
00:40:34,430 --> 00:40:36,130
my normative goal is for children

965
00:40:36,130 --> 00:40:39,760
to be able to actually
reach their full potential,

966
00:40:39,760 --> 00:40:42,983
regardless of their race
or class or inequality,

967
00:40:43,926 --> 00:40:47,480
and I do think it helps to
just be explicit about that,

968
00:40:47,480 --> 00:40:50,550
because you can call it a
political agenda or not,

969
00:40:50,550 --> 00:40:52,383
but the reason I teach this class is

970
00:40:52,383 --> 00:40:54,060
because I think is important,

971
00:40:54,060 --> 00:40:55,190
if I didn't think it was important

972
00:40:55,190 --> 00:40:56,640
I wouldn't be doing this job,

973
00:40:58,628 --> 00:41:00,242
because otherwise maybe I feel

974
00:41:00,242 --> 00:41:03,843
that people think you're
trying to sneak it in,

975
00:41:03,843 --> 00:41:05,870
I'm not sure this will fix it,

976

00:41:05,870 --> 00:41:07,447
because one extreme population is probably

977
00:41:07,447 --> 00:41:09,250
different than the folks
that are in your class,

978
00:41:09,250 --> 00:41:10,240
but I think at a minimum,

979
00:41:10,240 --> 00:41:11,180
it's like you laid out there,

980
00:41:11,180 --> 00:41:12,220
and that's why I teach this class

981
00:41:12,220 --> 00:41:14,310
and this is why I think it's important.

982
00:41:14,310 --> 00:41:15,520
And I'm gonna talk to you about the places

983
00:41:15,520 --> 00:41:17,910
in the world that I think
are doing a better job,

984
00:41:17,910 --> 00:41:19,883
but otherwise,

985
00:41:20,976 --> 00:41:23,560
the idea that we can actually

986
00:41:23,560 --> 00:41:26,200
bring everybody along
is probably a false one,

987
00:41:26,200 --> 00:41:28,880
and I think all you can do is try

988
00:41:28,880 --> 00:41:31,700
to be as open and honest in
your classroom as you can,

989

00:41:31,700 --> 00:41:35,840
and to say I didn't pull
this out of the air.

990

00:41:35,840 --> 00:41:40,840
I think also at least in mine
it's useful to really say,

991

00:41:41,210 --> 00:41:43,280
because it's part of what
Christina was talking about,

992

00:41:43,280 --> 00:41:44,810
about bringing the world
into your classroom,

993

00:41:44,810 --> 00:41:46,140
I think there's a way which at least

994

00:41:46,140 --> 00:41:48,319
within politics it's
been an argument about,

995

00:41:48,319 --> 00:41:53,319
as if either side who wins
doesn't really matter,

996

00:41:53,960 --> 00:41:55,790
and I think what I try
to talk about in my class

997

00:41:55,790 --> 00:41:58,210
is that actually the stakes
are very high for some people,

998

00:41:58,210 --> 00:42:01,110
the potential impact is huge,

999

00:42:01,110 --> 00:42:03,490
and so we can't just act like

1000

00:42:04,470 --> 00:42:05,995
either I pick this or I pick that,

1001
00:42:05,995 --> 00:42:08,360
there is no moral center
that we have to be,

1002
00:42:08,360 --> 00:42:11,480
that fairness and equity is the core,

1003
00:42:11,480 --> 00:42:13,070
and then we have to think about policies

1004
00:42:13,070 --> 00:42:14,410
within the context of that,

1005
00:42:14,410 --> 00:42:17,620
rather than just it's a
world of competing ideas

1006
00:42:17,620 --> 00:42:19,550
and it's just a matter
of which one you pick,

1007
00:42:19,550 --> 00:42:22,950
personally I don't think that's our job,

1008
00:42:22,950 --> 00:42:25,040
and I don't know if that helped
but that's just a thought.

1009
00:42:25,040 --> 00:42:26,880
- [Robert] That's very helpful.

1010
00:42:26,880 --> 00:42:29,593
- I do something slightly
actually different,

1011
00:42:30,550 --> 00:42:33,630
so I didn't do it since Trump was elected,

1012
00:42:33,630 --> 00:42:35,870

so I don't know how this would change,

1013

00:42:35,870 --> 00:42:37,750
but I had an assignment,

1014

00:42:37,750 --> 00:42:41,100
so in sociology we do usually
all empirical, et cetera,

1015

00:42:41,100 --> 00:42:43,800
and I had to read a few political

1016

00:42:43,800 --> 00:42:46,680
theory pieces about open borders,

1017

00:42:46,680 --> 00:42:48,620
and they just had to read it,

1018

00:42:48,620 --> 00:42:52,521
and then I had also a pro-border,

1019

00:42:52,521 --> 00:42:55,120
or a less open border perspective,

1020

00:42:55,120 --> 00:42:57,990
and then one of their
assignments is to write

1021

00:42:57,990 --> 00:43:01,210
an argument about what
should immigration policy

1022

00:43:01,210 --> 00:43:02,430
be in the United States,

1023

00:43:02,430 --> 00:43:03,263
and I tell them,

1024

00:43:03,263 --> 00:43:05,660
I say you are allowed to
advocate for open borders,

1025
00:43:05,660 --> 00:43:07,140
that is absolutely fine,

1026
00:43:07,140 --> 00:43:09,060
but you have to think very seriously

1027
00:43:09,060 --> 00:43:10,290
about the consequences

1028
00:43:10,290 --> 00:43:13,190
if you adopt an open border perspective,

1029
00:43:13,190 --> 00:43:14,630
and then I also argue,

1030
00:43:14,630 --> 00:43:16,927
realize if you adopt an
open border perspective

1031
00:43:16,927 --> 00:43:17,840
there will be hundreds of thousands

1032
00:43:17,840 --> 00:43:19,470
of people who will be coming in,

1033
00:43:19,470 --> 00:43:21,070
and if you're worried about price,

1034
00:43:21,070 --> 00:43:23,160
like rents in the Bay
Area and you're worried

1035
00:43:23,160 --> 00:43:24,980
about not enough schools
and things like that,

1036
00:43:24,980 --> 00:43:26,780
you're gonna have to think
through the consequences,

1037
00:43:26,780 --> 00:43:28,540

and then for people who
don't want open borders,

1038

00:43:28,540 --> 00:43:31,580

I say for you guys
you're gonna have to try

1039

00:43:31,580 --> 00:43:34,240

to figure out what is the
number of people that we let in,

1040

00:43:34,240 --> 00:43:35,240

and on what basis,

1041

00:43:35,240 --> 00:43:37,210

because as soon as you
don't have open borders

1042

00:43:37,210 --> 00:43:39,600

you must make decisions
between human beings,

1043

00:43:39,600 --> 00:43:42,020

so you're gonna have to
articulate a moral stance

1044

00:43:42,020 --> 00:43:43,400

as to why some people are allowed

1045

00:43:43,400 --> 00:43:45,075

in and other people are not allowed in,

1046

00:43:45,075 --> 00:43:46,920

and the students hate it,

1047

00:43:46,920 --> 00:43:49,394

because you have to make choices,

1048

00:43:49,394 --> 00:43:51,900

and it's real right,

1049

00:43:51,900 --> 00:43:54,330

then they're like, oh but I
really want to help refugees,

1050

00:43:54,330 --> 00:43:56,272
but then on the other hand,

1051

00:43:56,272 --> 00:43:57,105
if you give too many refugees

1052

00:43:57,105 --> 00:43:59,336
there's not gonna be family reunification,

1053

00:43:59,336 --> 00:44:01,308
and they hate the assignment,

1054

00:44:01,308 --> 00:44:03,670
but they have to grapple with values,

1055

00:44:03,670 --> 00:44:05,200
and so I say to them,

1056

00:44:05,200 --> 00:44:06,869
you have to layout your values,

1057

00:44:06,869 --> 00:44:07,780
think about your values,

1058

00:44:07,780 --> 00:44:09,880
they do what they have to do,

1059

00:44:09,880 --> 00:44:11,510
and then we go into the empirics,

1060

00:44:11,510 --> 00:44:13,590
of if this was your value
how do you get there,

1061

00:44:13,590 --> 00:44:15,370
is that the way to get to your values,

1062

00:44:15,370 --> 00:44:16,970

but they have to grapple with it in a way

1063

00:44:16,970 --> 00:44:19,730
that is more serious than
just this party says this,

1064

00:44:19,730 --> 00:44:21,380
or these people say that,

1065

00:44:21,380 --> 00:44:23,719
and so therefore I'm gonna
be against it or for it,

1066

00:44:23,719 --> 00:44:28,082
but they didn't like it at the start,

1067

00:44:28,082 --> 00:44:29,213
by the end they were okay.

1068

00:44:30,130 --> 00:44:31,933
- [Victoria] That's called
productive discussion.

1069

00:44:33,120 --> 00:44:34,333
- Sure, yeah,

1070

00:44:35,450 --> 00:44:38,220
but again it's not a right or,

1071

00:44:38,220 --> 00:44:39,680
these things are complicated,

1072

00:44:39,680 --> 00:44:41,080
especially if you're talking
about public policies,

1073

00:44:41,080 --> 00:44:42,380
there is no right answer,

1074

00:44:42,380 --> 00:44:43,213
there is no simple answer,

1075
00:44:43,213 --> 00:44:45,260
and I think the degree to which,

1076
00:44:45,260 --> 00:44:46,721
because on some level,

1077
00:44:46,721 --> 00:44:49,057
adapting a label of,

1078
00:44:49,057 --> 00:44:50,500
first of all we don't we don't

1079
00:44:50,500 --> 00:44:51,720
even have left in this country,

1080
00:44:51,720 --> 00:44:53,254
we just need to talk about that,

1081
00:44:53,254 --> 00:44:55,572
this is the conservative versus,

1082
00:44:55,572 --> 00:44:57,590
they're caricatures,

1083
00:44:57,590 --> 00:44:59,340
and so I would hope we
would ask our students

1084
00:44:59,340 --> 00:45:01,360
to in fact not create
strawmen of that sort,

1085
00:45:01,360 --> 00:45:04,967
and in fact really get into
what is at the core of an issue,

1086
00:45:04,967 --> 00:45:07,404
and do not get away with
that simplistic dismissal

1087
00:45:07,404 --> 00:45:11,180

of hopes of people on either side.

1088

00:45:11,180 --> 00:45:13,193

- One easy thing you can do,

1089

00:45:13,193 --> 00:45:17,460

I'm wondering what does
that pushback look like,

1090

00:45:17,460 --> 00:45:20,513

is it just a small subset of students,

1091

00:45:21,400 --> 00:45:22,460

are you getting that from,

1092

00:45:22,460 --> 00:45:25,693

because sometimes it can be
just one very vocal student

1093

00:45:25,693 --> 00:45:30,180

or two very vocal students
that destabilize us,

1094

00:45:30,180 --> 00:45:32,173

or make us question,

1095

00:45:33,520 --> 00:45:35,220

but it's not a shared sentiment,

1096

00:45:35,220 --> 00:45:37,920

and so I'll frame that opportunity

1097

00:45:37,920 --> 00:45:40,170

as a discussion point in class,

1098

00:45:40,170 --> 00:45:45,170

well some people have
suggested this and that,

1099

00:45:45,340 --> 00:45:47,960

what other cases would I use to compare

1100
00:45:47,960 --> 00:45:52,674
or making that as a moment
and putting that back on them,

1101
00:45:52,674 --> 00:45:55,270
and often times that conversation
won't really bubble up,

1102
00:45:55,270 --> 00:45:59,000
it allows you to see what
does that pushback look like,

1103
00:45:59,000 --> 00:46:00,330
is that a real sentiment,

1104
00:46:00,330 --> 00:46:04,277
or is it just the way we are
working in politics right now,

1105
00:46:04,277 --> 00:46:05,743
one really vocal person.

1106
00:46:06,622 --> 00:46:07,970
- And if it's a really big class,

1107
00:46:07,970 --> 00:46:09,870
the iClicker surveys are sometimes

1108
00:46:09,870 --> 00:46:12,096
very useful pedagogical
tool for those purposes,

1109
00:46:12,096 --> 00:46:14,280
to really ask people their opinions

1110
00:46:14,280 --> 00:46:15,920
and their experiences and
other kinds of things,

1111
00:46:15,920 --> 00:46:17,320
to put that context out there

1112
00:46:17,320 --> 00:46:19,640
for all the ones who aren't talking.

1113
00:46:19,640 --> 00:46:20,473
- [Man] Yeah that's good.

1114
00:46:22,088 --> 00:46:23,403
- [Man] Hi,

1115
00:46:24,898 --> 00:46:28,120
so I teach environmental studies,

1116
00:46:28,120 --> 00:46:31,763
so I get a version of
your problem all the time,

1117
00:46:33,680 --> 00:46:37,020
and it reminds me of Stephen Colbert,

1118
00:46:37,020 --> 00:46:37,970
The Colbert Report,

1119
00:46:39,690 --> 00:46:42,133
reality has a liberal bias,

1120
00:46:44,911 --> 00:46:48,700
and there is a real problem
in environmental studies

1121
00:46:48,700 --> 00:46:51,380
and probably in a lot of our fields,

1122
00:46:51,380 --> 00:46:55,730
in which we have people with
particular different kinds

1123
00:46:55,730 --> 00:46:58,520
of political belief systems

1124
00:46:58,520 --> 00:47:03,520
that aren't really as compatible

with reality as others,

1125

00:47:04,780 --> 00:47:07,795
and it's very difficult to deal with that,

1126

00:47:07,795 --> 00:47:11,883
I came here today to start
to grapple with that better,

1127

00:47:14,140 --> 00:47:15,070
all great ideas,

1128

00:47:15,070 --> 00:47:16,350
bring up facts,

1129

00:47:16,350 --> 00:47:17,863
bring up data,

1130

00:47:19,200 --> 00:47:21,830
make them make policy that fits

1131

00:47:21,830 --> 00:47:24,480
some kind of assigned position,

1132

00:47:24,480 --> 00:47:26,370
or even let them choose their position,

1133

00:47:26,370 --> 00:47:27,830
and come up with hard decisions,

1134

00:47:27,830 --> 00:47:29,660
make them do the hard decisions

1135

00:47:29,660 --> 00:47:33,160
of allocating immigration or whatever,

1136

00:47:33,160 --> 00:47:36,290
whatever resource allocation
you are allocating,

1137

00:47:36,290 --> 00:47:38,330

so I find this,

1138

00:47:38,330 --> 00:47:40,880
it's a really interesting possibly

1139

00:47:40,880 --> 00:47:44,030
extremely productive conversation,

1140

00:47:44,030 --> 00:47:49,030
and I think it really
frankly goes pretty deep,

1141

00:47:49,100 --> 00:47:52,063
maybe a lot deeper than
we've touched on here today,

1142

00:47:53,291 --> 00:47:57,483
about communicating
across political divides,

1143

00:47:59,244 --> 00:48:00,844
and just speaking with Mia here,

1144

00:48:02,270 --> 00:48:04,500
I hope it's okay I just mention this,

1145

00:48:04,500 --> 00:48:07,163
her frustration that sometimes in classes,

1146

00:48:08,100 --> 00:48:13,100
a student will make a
statement based on some kind

1147

00:48:13,120 --> 00:48:15,440
of political position that's not very

1148

00:48:15,440 --> 00:48:19,323
tenable according to what we
know about facts, et cetera,

1149

00:48:20,197 --> 00:48:21,530
and the faculty member will leave

1150
00:48:21,530 --> 00:48:23,663
it there on the table unchallenged,

1151
00:48:25,330 --> 00:48:26,290
and it's very frustrating,

1152
00:48:26,290 --> 00:48:31,245
because it kind of gives
it this aura of truthiness,

1153
00:48:31,245 --> 00:48:32,843
to use another Colbert,

1154
00:48:34,552 --> 00:48:37,302
that because it's unchallenged
it's there on the table,

1155
00:48:39,637 --> 00:48:40,470
and maybe it's a truth,

1156
00:48:40,470 --> 00:48:43,530
and it arises out of this idea I think

1157
00:48:43,530 --> 00:48:45,970
which is really at the basis of probably

1158
00:48:45,970 --> 00:48:47,600
the problem we're discussing here,

1159
00:48:47,600 --> 00:48:51,630
which is that the idea that all views have

1160
00:48:51,630 --> 00:48:53,303
some kind of validity to them.

1161
00:48:55,238 --> 00:48:56,071
- Or equal validity.

1162
00:48:56,071 --> 00:48:56,904
- [Man] Or equal validity,

1163

00:48:56,904 --> 00:48:58,247

yeah thank you,

1164

00:48:59,310 --> 00:49:02,930

so to me the depth that this gets into,

1165

00:49:02,930 --> 00:49:07,930

is real deep ontologically
and metaphysical assumptions

1166

00:49:08,236 --> 00:49:12,100

that ground different political points

1167

00:49:12,100 --> 00:49:13,990

of view and their policies,

1168

00:49:13,990 --> 00:49:16,200

and how to challenge
those in the classroom,

1169

00:49:16,200 --> 00:49:20,780

and even further part of my research

1170

00:49:20,780 --> 00:49:22,763

is in environmental psychology,

1171

00:49:24,482 --> 00:49:25,743

and what's happening now,

1172

00:49:26,805 --> 00:49:28,530

with global climate change

1173

00:49:28,530 --> 00:49:31,140

and other problems is an entrenchment,

1174

00:49:31,140 --> 00:49:34,760

because probably this is
a really serious dynamic

1175

00:49:34,760 --> 00:49:38,040

for this question of
politics in the classroom,

1176

00:49:38,040 --> 00:49:42,460
which is that denial arises,

1177

00:49:42,460 --> 00:49:46,990
and fears are rising over
possible ecological collapse

1178

00:49:46,990 --> 00:49:49,400
and societal collapse with the amount

1179

00:49:49,400 --> 00:49:50,840
of contention we have going on

1180

00:49:50,840 --> 00:49:53,603
in our politics and these other problems,

1181

00:49:56,143 --> 00:49:58,924
and the research is
showing that people get

1182

00:49:58,924 --> 00:50:03,070
into processes of denial and simply

1183

00:50:03,070 --> 00:50:07,820
can't see global climate
change for various reasons,

1184

00:50:07,820 --> 00:50:10,160
or can't see the problems of emigration,

1185

00:50:10,160 --> 00:50:14,083
or the humanity of those immigrants,

1186

00:50:15,010 --> 00:50:18,963
so we have some deeper
things going on here,

1187

00:50:18,963 --> 00:50:20,730
I think I would love it if

1188
00:50:20,730 --> 00:50:23,013
this would be a series of conversation,

1189
00:50:24,510 --> 00:50:27,560
I think it really runs deep in questions

1190
00:50:27,560 --> 00:50:31,841
of pedagogy and epistemology
and metaphysics as well.

1191
00:50:31,841 --> 00:50:34,475
- [Victoria] We have all
just been invited back,

1192
00:50:34,475 --> 00:50:36,283
that's what I heard,

1193
00:50:36,283 --> 00:50:38,783
other questions and comments?

1194
00:50:40,061 --> 00:50:43,978
(woman mumbles off-microphone)

1195
00:50:58,276 --> 00:51:00,160
- I was just gonna say I think I'm lucky

1196
00:51:00,160 --> 00:51:02,043
that education is a
place where you can very

1197
00:51:02,043 --> 00:51:05,040
much like emigration say a
pox on both their houses,

1198
00:51:05,040 --> 00:51:08,700
and that both parties
have actually done harm,

1199
00:51:08,700 --> 00:51:12,453
over time I think climate
change is a little bit now more,

1200
00:51:14,060 --> 00:51:16,610
but I think it is a deeper conversation

1201
00:51:16,610 --> 00:51:18,020
about the role of higher education,

1202
00:51:18,020 --> 00:51:20,170
and to the extent to
which we're gonna maintain

1203
00:51:20,170 --> 00:51:21,380
this idea of false equivalency,

1204
00:51:21,380 --> 00:51:24,090
or if we're gonna be a place that's really

1205
00:51:24,090 --> 00:51:26,510
about training students
to think empirically

1206
00:51:26,510 --> 00:51:29,710
to not let those statements based

1207
00:51:29,710 --> 00:51:33,100
on either fake information or inaccurate

1208
00:51:33,100 --> 00:51:35,730
information stand with equal weight,

1209
00:51:35,730 --> 00:51:38,810
I think it is a deep set of questions

1210
00:51:38,810 --> 00:51:41,560
that intersects with being more inclusive

1211
00:51:41,560 --> 00:51:44,220
in terms of who is in the
front of the classroom as well,

1212
00:51:44,220 --> 00:51:46,990

because I think it
changes then how you talk

1213
00:51:46,990 --> 00:51:49,228
about these things and
how you live these things,

1214
00:51:49,228 --> 00:51:52,670
the Muslim man happened when
I was teaching this class,

1215
00:51:52,670 --> 00:51:53,940
and I had to share with the students

1216
00:51:53,940 --> 00:51:55,290
my parents were refugees,

1217
00:51:55,290 --> 00:51:58,520
we were lucky that this
country allowed us to come in,

1218
00:51:58,520 --> 00:52:00,880
and so the stakes for me are different,

1219
00:52:00,880 --> 00:52:02,610
because of my life experiences,

1220
00:52:02,610 --> 00:52:07,430
so I think it's a big shift
in how we do our work,

1221
00:52:07,430 --> 00:52:10,480
but I think it does require us

1222
00:52:10,480 --> 00:52:15,480
to continually really rethink
our practice and our purpose,

1223
00:52:16,170 --> 00:52:17,670
and it's not easy,

1224
00:52:17,670 --> 00:52:19,230

and some students will just think

1225

00:52:19,230 --> 00:52:23,130
it's not valid or helpful or biased,

1226

00:52:23,130 --> 00:52:24,610
I think the fact of the matter

1227

00:52:24,610 --> 00:52:26,800
is not everybody is gonna
be happy singing Kumbaya,

1228

00:52:26,800 --> 00:52:28,900
because these are hard things,

1229

00:52:28,900 --> 00:52:31,050
so maybe if we don't
have that expectation,

1230

00:52:32,134 --> 00:52:35,780
it feels a little better
as a Professor right?

1231

00:52:35,780 --> 00:52:37,350
- [Man] If I cannot be bothered

1232

00:52:37,350 --> 00:52:40,223
by the few evaluations I get,

1233

00:52:41,070 --> 00:52:43,410
he's saying these things
because he's a liberal.

1234

00:52:43,410 --> 00:52:45,760
- But see this is the
psychology evaluations,

1235

00:52:45,760 --> 00:52:47,150
you can get stellar evaluations

1236

00:52:47,150 --> 00:52:52,150
and you always focus on

those ones that they hate it,

1237

00:52:52,660 --> 00:52:55,120

I think that's just human nature,

1238

00:52:55,120 --> 00:52:58,230

but we also know all the
bias in evaluation to,

1239

00:52:58,230 --> 00:52:59,063

so you know.

1240

00:52:59,970 --> 00:53:01,807

- [Victoria] We have a
question at the back.

1241

00:53:01,807 --> 00:53:02,640

- [Man] I just wanted to add a comment,

1242

00:53:02,640 --> 00:53:04,390

building a little over
what Christina had said

1243

00:53:04,390 --> 00:53:06,937

about the arts for this
particular question

1244

00:53:06,937 --> 00:53:08,380

of sustainability indicators,

1245

00:53:08,380 --> 00:53:10,560

I think that there is a
lot of research showing

1246

00:53:10,560 --> 00:53:13,730

how people reinterpret
evidence to fit narratives,

1247

00:53:13,730 --> 00:53:17,180

and how visual storytelling
can be a really compelling

1248

00:53:17,180 --> 00:53:19,740
way of making a point
rather than a trendline,

1249
00:53:19,740 --> 00:53:20,880
I don't know if one idea

1250
00:53:20,880 --> 00:53:23,020
is to actually maybe use documentaries,

1251
00:53:23,020 --> 00:53:28,020
or clips that show what life
is like in these societies,

1252
00:53:28,470 --> 00:53:30,610
and that break down
stereotypes that students

1253
00:53:30,610 --> 00:53:34,777
may have about the communists
or something to that effect,

1254
00:53:34,777 --> 00:53:35,610
and to combine that,

1255
00:53:35,610 --> 00:53:36,943
so not in lieu of the evidence

1256
00:53:36,943 --> 00:53:39,240
that you present or the indicators,

1257
00:53:39,240 --> 00:53:41,590
but just thinking about different ways

1258
00:53:41,590 --> 00:53:44,880
of presenting the story that you want

1259
00:53:44,880 --> 00:53:48,330
to tell that might be more compelling,

1260
00:53:48,330 --> 00:53:49,320
more gripping,

1261
00:53:49,320 --> 00:53:50,190
that will give,

1262
00:53:50,190 --> 00:53:52,090
so people in these societies

1263
00:53:52,090 --> 00:53:54,970
and their voice to a front stage,

1264
00:53:54,970 --> 00:53:57,660
and I imagine there's lots of material out

1265
00:53:57,660 --> 00:54:01,893
there that you probably just
find on YouTube. (mumbles)

1266
00:54:03,950 --> 00:54:07,620
- I also just sort of flip
the deeper question onto them

1267
00:54:07,620 --> 00:54:11,070
and say more than once I find myself

1268
00:54:11,070 --> 00:54:13,700
this semester saying
okay these are the facts,

1269
00:54:13,700 --> 00:54:16,340
I know we have different
definitions of facts,

1270
00:54:16,340 --> 00:54:17,173
but the definition that

1271
00:54:17,173 --> 00:54:19,860
we are gonna use is data
collected in this way,

1272
00:54:19,860 --> 00:54:21,960
and I'll tell them this,

1273

00:54:21,960 --> 00:54:24,100
and they laugh or whatnot,

1274

00:54:24,100 --> 00:54:26,830
but I'm consistently reminding them

1275

00:54:26,830 --> 00:54:29,543
that we live in
politically perilous times,

1276

00:54:31,058 --> 00:54:34,180
I have modules in my class,

1277

00:54:34,180 --> 00:54:36,960
one module is on immigration assimilation,

1278

00:54:36,960 --> 00:54:39,410
another one is on the
education of the elites,

1279

00:54:39,410 --> 00:54:41,766
and that's the way I teach it,

1280

00:54:41,766 --> 00:54:44,990
but after every module I'm
consistently going back,

1281

00:54:44,990 --> 00:54:45,823
okay,

1282

00:54:45,823 --> 00:54:48,240
why is this important to know right now,

1283

00:54:48,240 --> 00:54:51,350
and I asked that question
to them why is it important

1284

00:54:51,350 --> 00:54:53,820
to know right now in the
context that we live in,

1285

00:54:53,820 --> 00:54:55,150
in the context of social media,

1286
00:54:55,150 --> 00:54:57,110
in the context of certain political

1287
00:54:57,110 --> 00:54:58,830
polarization in this context,

1288
00:54:58,830 --> 00:55:01,056
and I think that sort of
continuous reflection,

1289
00:55:01,056 --> 00:55:03,130
and I haven't done this before,

1290
00:55:03,130 --> 00:55:05,190
I've just been motivated to do it now more

1291
00:55:05,190 --> 00:55:07,000
so because students are asking more

1292
00:55:07,000 --> 00:55:08,448
about what to do with this,

1293
00:55:08,448 --> 00:55:12,300
what I do more broadly,

1294
00:55:12,300 --> 00:55:14,130
not just what I do with this knowledge

1295
00:55:14,130 --> 00:55:15,247
about educational inequality,

1296
00:55:15,247 --> 00:55:16,640
more broadly than that,

1297
00:55:16,640 --> 00:55:19,070
what I do me as a person coming out

1298
00:55:19,070 --> 00:55:21,124

of Berkeley with this
degree at this moment,

1299

00:55:21,124 --> 00:55:23,490
and so I throw that question back at them,

1300

00:55:23,490 --> 00:55:25,350
I actually make it extra credit,

1301

00:55:25,350 --> 00:55:27,190
like these little extra
credit reflections.

1302

00:55:27,190 --> 00:55:29,050
So one of my modules,

1303

00:55:29,050 --> 00:55:32,010
and it's a culture class,

1304

00:55:32,010 --> 00:55:33,370
so it's quite varied,

1305

00:55:33,370 --> 00:55:36,090
but one of them is on
religious conversion,

1306

00:55:36,090 --> 00:55:37,950
conversion to Pentecostalism

1307

00:55:37,950 --> 00:55:41,995
and the rise of Pentecostalism
across Latin America,

1308

00:55:41,995 --> 00:55:44,410
and I hadn't done this before,

1309

00:55:44,410 --> 00:55:46,450
but now it's like why
do we care right now,

1310

00:55:46,450 --> 00:55:47,360
why,

1311

00:55:47,360 --> 00:55:49,070
and I leave it open,

1312

00:55:49,070 --> 00:55:50,940
so aside from theories that they learn

1313

00:55:50,940 --> 00:55:52,920
about conversion and what
that means for culture,

1314

00:55:52,920 --> 00:55:54,978
and maybe some sort of patterns

1315

00:55:54,978 --> 00:55:57,980
of religious conversion
and political ideas,

1316

00:55:57,980 --> 00:56:01,010
right now it's an interesting time

1317

00:56:01,010 --> 00:56:04,264
with all the elections in
Latin America, et cetera,

1318

00:56:04,264 --> 00:56:06,490
but I leave it open ended,

1319

00:56:06,490 --> 00:56:08,460
and I leave it for them to write

1320

00:56:08,460 --> 00:56:10,150
it up to me and then I discuss it,

1321

00:56:10,150 --> 00:56:12,780
and it's about them and this moment,

1322

00:56:12,780 --> 00:56:16,350
interacting with the text and
interacting with the world,

1323

00:56:16,350 --> 00:56:17,840
and I think this is creating

1324
00:56:17,840 --> 00:56:22,040
I hope a continuous
reflection about themselves,

1325
00:56:22,040 --> 00:56:23,200
about the moment,

1326
00:56:23,200 --> 00:56:25,840
about what data means,

1327
00:56:25,840 --> 00:56:27,081
what these trends mean,

1328
00:56:27,081 --> 00:56:29,510
where they stand,

1329
00:56:29,510 --> 00:56:33,100
I'm hoping that that is gives them some

1330
00:56:33,100 --> 00:56:34,250
ease for many of them,

1331
00:56:34,250 --> 00:56:36,520
and for the few that I'll get

1332
00:56:38,650 --> 00:56:41,010
they're like four out of 120 something,

1333
00:56:41,010 --> 00:56:44,650
so I actually don't
expect to win them all,

1334
00:56:44,650 --> 00:56:47,210
I actually expect that
I'll get a lot of pushback,

1335
00:56:47,210 --> 00:56:49,830
it might come because as a woman,

1336
00:56:49,830 --> 00:56:51,100
as a woman of color lecturer

1337
00:56:51,100 --> 00:56:54,830
I just know that I'm
not gonna get them all.

1338
00:56:54,830 --> 00:56:56,370
- [Victoria] We have
another question in here,

1339
00:56:56,370 --> 00:56:59,800
but I was thinking that
sometimes I'm an abolitionist,

1340
00:56:59,800 --> 00:57:00,940
so that says a lot,

1341
00:57:00,940 --> 00:57:03,250
but after the shattering
of starting points,

1342
00:57:03,250 --> 00:57:04,900
so I often use that phrase,

1343
00:57:04,900 --> 00:57:07,190
we can imagine the
destruction of the planet,

1344
00:57:07,190 --> 00:57:10,480
but we can't imagine the
destruction of capitalism,

1345
00:57:10,480 --> 00:57:11,997
where do you move from
a statement like that,

1346
00:57:11,997 --> 00:57:13,690
it starts to unpack I think some

1347
00:57:13,690 --> 00:57:17,490
of the hidden narratives around

what are we talking about,

1348

00:57:17,490 --> 00:57:19,440
and I think it's this
idea of stakes again,

1349

00:57:19,440 --> 00:57:21,860
what are we talking about
when we have a stake

1350

00:57:21,860 --> 00:57:23,700
in the ground around our narrative

1351

00:57:23,700 --> 00:57:27,030
that's really contained for
us rather than breaking open,

1352

00:57:27,030 --> 00:57:29,211
do you have a question?

1353

00:57:29,211 --> 00:57:30,360
- [Woman] Yeah,

1354

00:57:30,360 --> 00:57:33,188
this has been touched
on a little bit already,

1355

00:57:33,188 --> 00:57:36,670
there is a phenomemon and I
can't remember the name of it,

1356

00:57:36,670 --> 00:57:40,520
where somebody holds an
opinion and they learn facts

1357

00:57:40,520 --> 00:57:41,850
that are contrary to the opinion

1358

00:57:41,850 --> 00:57:46,683
and they dig in deeper
into their own stance,

1359

00:57:48,090 --> 00:57:49,290
I think this is partially

1360
00:57:49,290 --> 00:57:51,733
what the gentleman in
front of me was saying,

1361
00:57:53,545 --> 00:57:54,387
but have you experienced that,

1362
00:57:54,387 --> 00:57:55,983
and what do you do around that?

1363
00:58:00,800 --> 00:58:02,160
- One of the things that I found,

1364
00:58:02,160 --> 00:58:04,240
and probably for those of you
that are parents in the room,

1365
00:58:04,240 --> 00:58:06,323
it's no different to
dealing with your children,

1366
00:58:07,660 --> 00:58:08,770
you as a teacher,

1367
00:58:08,770 --> 00:58:10,170
you as a parent can say whatever

1368
00:58:10,170 --> 00:58:11,941
you want to the students or your children,

1369
00:58:11,941 --> 00:58:13,710
but they don't hear it the same way

1370
00:58:13,710 --> 00:58:15,790
as one of their peers saying it,

1371
00:58:15,790 --> 00:58:19,170
and it's much more powerful
when their peers say it,

1372

00:58:19,170 --> 00:58:21,848
and so I've had a few
times where I've had maybe

1373

00:58:21,848 --> 00:58:25,683
a more conservative
student in the classroom,

1374

00:58:27,081 --> 00:58:29,960
who's been courageous
enough to say something,

1375

00:58:29,960 --> 00:58:34,960
and it's actually been a very
valuable learning experience,

1376

00:58:35,020 --> 00:58:37,960
because the students
take that more seriously,

1377

00:58:37,960 --> 00:58:39,623
and at least until recently there

1378

00:58:39,623 --> 00:58:42,220
have been very civil in responding,

1379

00:58:42,220 --> 00:58:45,180
so I remember this one
instance I was giving a talk,

1380

00:58:45,180 --> 00:58:46,013
and this is very much

1381

00:58:46,013 --> 00:58:49,360
about the facts maybe being
understood differently,

1382

00:58:49,360 --> 00:58:52,290
this was a while back
when Samuel Huntington

1383

00:58:52,290 --> 00:58:54,350
very famously talked about the Hispanic

1384
00:58:54,350 --> 00:58:56,490
threat which was gonna
undermine the United States,

1385
00:58:56,490 --> 00:58:58,350
and had a number of arguments,

1386
00:58:58,350 --> 00:58:59,638
yeah there you go,

1387
00:58:59,638 --> 00:59:01,670
a number of arguments about why

1388
00:59:01,670 --> 00:59:03,310
this was gonna be bad for the US,

1389
00:59:03,310 --> 00:59:05,900
and there are pieces of that argument

1390
00:59:05,900 --> 00:59:08,730
which was English is gonna be undermined,

1391
00:59:08,730 --> 00:59:11,246
Spanish is gonna be everywhere,

1392
00:59:11,246 --> 00:59:12,810
and then you can show facts,

1393
00:59:12,810 --> 00:59:16,620
in terms of immigrants today
learn English probably faster

1394
00:59:16,620 --> 00:59:17,710
than they did a hundred years ago,

1395
00:59:17,710 --> 00:59:19,500
by the second generation everybody

1396

00:59:19,500 --> 00:59:21,090
is speaking English virtually,

1397
00:59:21,090 --> 00:59:21,923
et cetera, et cetera,

1398
00:59:21,923 --> 00:59:22,756
so you can show these facts.

1399
00:59:22,756 --> 00:59:26,600
And there was a young man in
the class who was a veteran,

1400
00:59:26,600 --> 00:59:28,440
he had fought in Afghanistan,

1401
00:59:28,440 --> 00:59:29,373
people knew this,

1402
00:59:30,323 --> 00:59:32,910
and he came out and basically said,

1403
00:59:32,910 --> 00:59:35,430
I don't understand why everyone
doesn't just speak English,

1404
00:59:35,430 --> 00:59:37,120
I just think all of these languages,

1405
00:59:37,120 --> 00:59:37,953
this is silly,

1406
00:59:37,953 --> 00:59:39,910
it would be much easier if
everyone just spoke English,

1407
00:59:39,910 --> 00:59:42,170
and he said that in a
pretty respectful way,

1408
00:59:42,170 --> 00:59:44,970
but that's a pretty strong

comment when you have

1409

00:59:44,970 --> 00:59:46,810

two thirds of our graduate population

1410

00:59:46,810 --> 00:59:48,510

who are either first or second generation

1411

00:59:48,510 --> 00:59:50,550

immigrants hearing something like that,

1412

00:59:50,550 --> 00:59:51,850

and of course immediately

1413

00:59:51,850 --> 00:59:54,300

the students were like what's going on,

1414

00:59:54,300 --> 00:59:55,660

and the hard part of course

1415

00:59:55,660 --> 00:59:58,760

is moderating that in a respectful way,

1416

00:59:58,760 --> 01:00:00,360

but I allowed a number of students

1417

01:00:00,360 --> 01:00:02,940

to give their responses to that,

1418

01:00:02,940 --> 01:00:04,554

and then we tried to break it up,

1419

01:00:04,554 --> 01:00:06,120

what is going on,

1420

01:00:06,120 --> 01:00:07,130

what is the issue,

1421

01:00:07,130 --> 01:00:08,470

is there an economic issue,

1422

01:00:08,470 --> 01:00:10,370
we can't talk to each
other in the workplace,

1423

01:00:10,370 --> 01:00:11,620
is it a cultural issue,

1424

01:00:11,620 --> 01:00:14,710
our culture is being undermined
and who are we as a nation,

1425

01:00:14,710 --> 01:00:16,680
is it about threat,

1426

01:00:16,680 --> 01:00:18,719
is it just,

1427

01:00:18,719 --> 01:00:20,030
so we had a conversation,

1428

01:00:20,030 --> 01:00:22,060
and it ended up I think
being pretty positive,

1429

01:00:22,060 --> 01:00:23,622
I don't know if we
changed his mind at all,

1430

01:00:23,622 --> 01:00:25,770
but the other thing I said to students

1431

01:00:25,770 --> 01:00:28,260
is you have to hear positions

1432

01:00:28,260 --> 01:00:29,410
that you're not comfortable with,

1433

01:00:29,410 --> 01:00:31,390
because they exist outside
of the Berkeley campus,

1434

01:00:31,390 --> 01:00:34,550
and so you have to be able to answer them,

1435
01:00:34,550 --> 01:00:36,564
and I think actually one
of the bigger problems

1436
01:00:36,564 --> 01:00:38,760
I sometimes face is that what I'm talking

1437
01:00:38,760 --> 01:00:40,110
about immigration people

1438
01:00:40,110 --> 01:00:44,120
just don't Wanna say the Trump thing,

1439
01:00:44,120 --> 01:00:47,310
because on the Berkeley
campus there is a sense

1440
01:00:47,310 --> 01:00:48,370
that you're not allowed to say

1441
01:00:48,370 --> 01:00:50,050
those or you shouldn't be saying them,

1442
01:00:50,050 --> 01:00:52,040
and I personally don't espouse them,

1443
01:00:52,040 --> 01:00:53,610
but I do say to the students you have

1444
01:00:53,610 --> 01:00:56,490
to be able to answer it or
at least think through it,

1445
01:00:56,490 --> 01:00:58,054
and so let's do it in a safer spot

1446
01:00:58,054 --> 01:00:59,730
so that when you are confronted

1447

01:00:59,730 --> 01:01:01,700
with that in a less safe space,

1448

01:01:01,700 --> 01:01:03,890
you have some ideas of how to react,

1449

01:01:03,890 --> 01:01:06,160
and one student came to
me afterwards and said

1450

01:01:06,160 --> 01:01:08,020
that was a really valuable
way of thinking about it,

1451

01:01:08,020 --> 01:01:11,567
because her boyfriend was
from a very Republican family

1452

01:01:11,567 --> 01:01:13,180
and apparently the parents

1453

01:01:13,180 --> 01:01:15,550
had said some very hurtful things,

1454

01:01:15,550 --> 01:01:17,130
or that she understood as hurtful,

1455

01:01:17,130 --> 01:01:18,800
and so now she was
thinking through strategies

1456

01:01:18,800 --> 01:01:20,880
of how could she engage these parents

1457

01:01:20,880 --> 01:01:23,256
or at least provide a
safe space for herself

1458

01:01:23,256 --> 01:01:27,020
that she didn't feel
constantly this emotional toll

1459

01:01:27,020 --> 01:01:29,943
every time she was hanging out
with her boyfriend's parents.

1460

01:01:36,247 --> 01:01:38,130
- [Man] And with the veteran

1461

01:01:38,130 --> 01:01:39,880
how did you go on to construct

1462

01:01:39,880 --> 01:01:43,560
that space where it was a
respectful conversation,

1463

01:01:43,560 --> 01:01:44,520
how did that play out,

1464

01:01:44,520 --> 01:01:46,827
or in a situation like that,

1465

01:01:46,827 --> 01:01:50,749
and you mentioned when a
view goes unchallenged,

1466

01:01:50,749 --> 01:01:53,152
what do you do immediately after

1467

01:01:53,152 --> 01:01:57,322
that somebody stands up and
says something like that?

1468

01:01:57,322 --> 01:01:59,494
- I don't know my stomach clinches,

1469

01:01:59,494 --> 01:02:02,152
my stomach just clinches
and I'm like oh my God.

1470

01:02:02,152 --> 01:02:04,390
(laughs)

1471

01:02:04,390 --> 01:02:06,450
- I mean the way I handle it,

1472
01:02:06,450 --> 01:02:08,760
specifically if someone makes a statement

1473
01:02:08,760 --> 01:02:12,220
and a claim that's factually incorrect,

1474
01:02:12,220 --> 01:02:14,870
my first step is to
always with any student

1475
01:02:14,870 --> 01:02:19,104
from any perspective to always
provide factual correction,

1476
01:02:19,104 --> 01:02:22,480
and then I will often prefer,

1477
01:02:22,480 --> 01:02:25,602
I prefer to have other
students speak back,

1478
01:02:25,602 --> 01:02:28,420
so I see my job,

1479
01:02:28,420 --> 01:02:29,253
and then if they don't,

1480
01:02:29,253 --> 01:02:31,880
then I play the devil's
advocate regardless,

1481
01:02:31,880 --> 01:02:33,430
and I think that's the part,

1482
01:02:33,430 --> 01:02:35,630
is how we manage that conversation,

1483
01:02:35,630 --> 01:02:37,760
and how we referee,

1484

01:02:37,760 --> 01:02:40,590
and if they feel like they've
been heard and not dismissed,

1485

01:02:40,590 --> 01:02:42,490
it both makes students
more willing to talk,

1486

01:02:42,490 --> 01:02:44,450
but I think also makes other students,

1487

01:02:44,450 --> 01:02:46,550
it models for them how
they can speak back,

1488

01:02:46,550 --> 01:02:49,238
so that's just been my approach,

1489

01:02:49,238 --> 01:02:50,071
I don't know if that's the right approach,

1490

01:02:50,071 --> 01:02:55,071
but I definitely don't let things go,

1491

01:02:55,340 --> 01:02:56,173
if they're just,

1492

01:02:59,738 --> 01:03:03,050
just always bringing it
back to what's the evidence,

1493

01:03:03,050 --> 01:03:04,700
what do we actually know about this,

1494

01:03:04,700 --> 01:03:06,430
what really happened in history,

1495

01:03:06,430 --> 01:03:07,410
that kind of stuff.

1496

01:03:07,410 --> 01:03:10,010
- I find that in the class it's often easy

1497
01:03:10,010 --> 01:03:12,670
to say what do you think
to the rest of the class,

1498
01:03:12,670 --> 01:03:16,736
and it's actually really
helpful once it aired out,

1499
01:03:16,736 --> 01:03:17,569
so it's aired out,

1500
01:03:17,569 --> 01:03:18,410
and then I say,

1501
01:03:18,410 --> 01:03:21,011
usually because we are
on the Berkeley campus

1502
01:03:21,011 --> 01:03:23,750
it takes a lot of courage for them

1503
01:03:23,750 --> 01:03:26,251
to come out with this sort of opinion,

1504
01:03:26,251 --> 01:03:30,020
so I'm often thanks for sharing that,

1505
01:03:30,020 --> 01:03:31,670
what do you all think,

1506
01:03:31,670 --> 01:03:32,860
so we go round,

1507
01:03:32,860 --> 01:03:36,212
and usually in my experience
students will air something,

1508
01:03:36,212 --> 01:03:38,500
sometimes they won't to have the facts,

1509

01:03:38,500 --> 01:03:40,852

but they'll have the
sentiment that this is wrong,

1510

01:03:40,852 --> 01:03:43,280

they'll have the sense well how can

1511

01:03:44,804 --> 01:03:45,637

you silence other people
or things like that,

1512

01:03:45,637 --> 01:03:47,460

it'll be more of a,

1513

01:03:47,460 --> 01:03:48,563

perhaps the,

1514

01:03:50,580 --> 01:03:51,413

yeah I guess the sentiment

1515

01:03:51,413 --> 01:03:54,250

in a political sense and
then I'll provide the facts,

1516

01:03:54,250 --> 01:03:57,223

and there's a sense of
engagement I'll ask,

1517

01:03:57,223 --> 01:04:01,210

but this is a really big topic,

1518

01:04:01,210 --> 01:04:02,840

and there is no,

1519

01:04:02,840 --> 01:04:05,360

at the end of the day what
is right and what is wrong,

1520

01:04:05,360 --> 01:04:07,910

and we have that conversation too,

1521

01:04:07,910 --> 01:04:08,863
but I think,

1522

01:04:09,830 --> 01:04:11,040
I don't know if you guys have had this,

1523

01:04:11,040 --> 01:04:12,833
but one of my difficulties is even being

1524

01:04:12,833 --> 01:04:15,150
able to create that moment,

1525

01:04:15,150 --> 01:04:16,832
because they are so valuable,

1526

01:04:16,832 --> 01:04:19,122
so sometimes what I do,

1527

01:04:19,122 --> 01:04:23,870
I construct that moment and
play the devil's advocate,

1528

01:04:23,870 --> 01:04:26,710
right now there's so much
out there in the news today,

1529

01:04:26,710 --> 01:04:29,370
that you can just sort of say for a while

1530

01:04:29,370 --> 01:04:32,873
I would go back to Newt
Gingrich speeches he would say,

1531

01:04:35,563 --> 01:04:38,450
I can just sort of look up something

1532

01:04:38,450 --> 01:04:40,858
on poverty on inequality on immigration,

1533

01:04:40,858 --> 01:04:42,430
on religion,

1534

01:04:42,430 --> 01:04:44,690

I can look it up for that day,

1535

01:04:44,690 --> 01:04:46,590

and I can tie it into the reading

1536

01:04:46,590 --> 01:04:48,643

and that creates the counterpoint,

1537

01:04:49,616 --> 01:04:51,560

for students to talk about,

1538

01:04:51,560 --> 01:04:53,380

but they are actually really

1539

01:04:53,380 --> 01:04:57,180

valuable moments that you want to foster,

1540

01:04:57,180 --> 01:04:59,713

but not at all and sort
of letting it hang there,

1541

01:05:00,910 --> 01:05:03,249

so if I don't have the facts,

1542

01:05:03,249 --> 01:05:05,530

so if something is hanging there

1543

01:05:05,530 --> 01:05:08,273

and I don't have the
facts to get it on hand,

1544

01:05:08,273 --> 01:05:10,750

I would say my sense is this,

1545

01:05:10,750 --> 01:05:13,210

and then I'd come back at the next lecture

1546

01:05:13,210 --> 01:05:17,580

with a much more expansive answer to that.

1547

01:05:19,011 --> 01:05:21,873

And the one thing about you
dig in deeper to your views,

1548

01:05:23,050 --> 01:05:24,830

I talk about that in class,

1549

01:05:24,830 --> 01:05:26,350

there's something about giving

1550

01:05:26,350 --> 01:05:30,240

them the studies and telling
them these were conducted,

1551

01:05:30,240 --> 01:05:31,900

studies conducted in a lab,

1552

01:05:31,900 --> 01:05:33,500

or studies conducted over time,

1553

01:05:33,500 --> 01:05:34,470

and we know that,

1554

01:05:34,470 --> 01:05:36,197

showing that to those students

1555

01:05:36,197 --> 01:05:40,113

and then allowing them
to think about that,

1556

01:05:41,070 --> 01:05:41,997

is really good,

1557

01:05:41,997 --> 01:05:43,050

because then it opens their eyes

1558

01:05:43,050 --> 01:05:47,831

to how were they absorbing
different types of information.

1559

01:05:47,831 --> 01:05:48,664
- This is a very small thing,

1560
01:05:48,664 --> 01:05:49,497
I don't know if this works,

1561
01:05:49,497 --> 01:05:51,050
but my stomach does clench,

1562
01:05:51,050 --> 01:05:52,500
when I have this moment where I'm like

1563
01:05:52,500 --> 01:05:56,180
oh my goodness is this all
gonna blow up or whatever,

1564
01:05:56,180 --> 01:05:59,320
so I love writing on
whiteboards or blackboards,

1565
01:05:59,320 --> 01:06:00,980
so I turn and I start writing,

1566
01:06:00,980 --> 01:06:02,310
and this is just to give myself

1567
01:06:02,310 --> 01:06:05,393
my 15 seconds to say
what the hell do I do.

1568
01:06:06,590 --> 01:06:09,283
But also by writing out what people say,

1569
01:06:10,770 --> 01:06:13,590
the students are much more
careful in what they say,

1570
01:06:13,590 --> 01:06:15,660
because I'm writing down what they say,

1571
01:06:15,660 --> 01:06:18,400
so someone will say something,

1572

01:06:18,400 --> 01:06:20,380
and they'll be like well why
don't we all speak English,

1573

01:06:20,380 --> 01:06:23,600
so then I'll put on the board English,

1574

01:06:23,600 --> 01:06:25,530
all I'm doing is putting
the word English down,

1575

01:06:25,530 --> 01:06:27,990
and then I turn to the
student and I'll be like,

1576

01:06:27,990 --> 01:06:29,900
so why would you say

1577

01:06:29,900 --> 01:06:31,710
that everyone should just learn English,

1578

01:06:31,710 --> 01:06:33,779
and it's like, um,

1579

01:06:33,779 --> 01:06:35,450
and then they have to articulate why,

1580

01:06:35,450 --> 01:06:36,690
is it a value, it's a cultural value,

1581

01:06:36,690 --> 01:06:38,040
is it about economics whatever,

1582

01:06:38,040 --> 01:06:40,210
and then you start
writing these words down,

1583

01:06:40,210 --> 01:06:41,050
so then that also gives all

1584

01:06:41,050 --> 01:06:42,610
the other students time to think,

1585
01:06:42,610 --> 01:06:46,160
and then I think writing
it on the board makes

1586
01:06:46,160 --> 01:06:48,511
it more real so you can't just blow off,

1587
01:06:48,511 --> 01:06:51,500
that's a minor little technique

1588
01:06:51,500 --> 01:06:53,620
but it's enough to cool
things down a little bit,

1589
01:06:53,620 --> 01:06:56,110
and then I try to say
okay is this a value,

1590
01:06:56,110 --> 01:06:58,330
can we have an empirical
discussion about this,

1591
01:06:58,330 --> 01:07:01,160
if this was our value what
would be a research project

1592
01:07:01,160 --> 01:07:02,840
we can do to evaluate whether we really

1593
01:07:02,840 --> 01:07:05,840
do need English to have
better economic growth,

1594
01:07:05,840 --> 01:07:08,730
so then I kind of align
the normative sometimes

1595
01:07:08,730 --> 01:07:11,023
by just saying what would
be the research project.

1596
01:07:12,030 --> 01:07:13,620
- [Victoria] I think Andrea you wanted,

1597
01:07:13,620 --> 01:07:14,690
we're almost out of time,

1598
01:07:14,690 --> 01:07:17,180
so if you can just be brief
with these final comments.

1599
01:07:17,180 --> 01:07:19,220
- [Andrea] I'm Andrea, I'm
in the Public Service Center,

1600
01:07:19,220 --> 01:07:20,940
and I also work with Victoria

1601
01:07:20,940 --> 01:07:23,170
for American Cultures Engaged Scholarship,

1602
01:07:23,170 --> 01:07:26,010
I was picking up on when you said that

1603
01:07:26,010 --> 01:07:28,830
and they know in
sociology especially folks

1604
01:07:28,830 --> 01:07:32,330
are looking for a glimmer
of hope or what can I do,

1605
01:07:32,330 --> 01:07:34,670
I wanted to mention
both of those programs,

1606
01:07:34,670 --> 01:07:37,127
it includes of course some
folks you already know,

1607
01:07:37,127 --> 01:07:39,570
but also in the Public Service Center

1608

01:07:39,570 --> 01:07:40,740

we have different social

1609

01:07:40,740 --> 01:07:43,060

justice programs for undergrad students,

1610

01:07:43,060 --> 01:07:46,850

so whether they spent a
summer in Washington DC,

1611

01:07:46,850 --> 01:07:51,333

or do an alternative brake on immigration,

1612

01:07:51,333 --> 01:07:54,230

or whatever else we have
a variety of programs,

1613

01:07:54,230 --> 01:07:56,880

and I think really getting students

1614

01:07:56,880 --> 01:08:00,026

into communities where
there are experts working

1615

01:08:00,026 --> 01:08:02,670

on these issues every day who provide

1616

01:08:02,670 --> 01:08:05,840

new perspectives and counter narratives,

1617

01:08:05,840 --> 01:08:09,460

and so I'm happy to
partner with you any time

1618

01:08:09,460 --> 01:08:12,673

or come talk about those
programs in your classrooms.

1619

01:08:14,090 --> 01:08:15,037

- [Victoria] That such
a good point Andrea,

1620
01:08:15,037 --> 01:08:16,240
and let's give a shout out for

1621
01:08:16,240 --> 01:08:19,033
the democracy camp that
IGS runs in the summer.

1622
01:08:20,236 --> 01:08:22,167
- No, spring break.
- Oh, spring break.

1623
01:08:22,167 --> 01:08:24,130
- But I also want to say I bring

1624
01:08:24,130 --> 01:08:25,450
the leadership community organizations

1625
01:08:25,450 --> 01:08:27,570
working on my issues to talk to the class,

1626
01:08:27,570 --> 01:08:28,720
that's another easy way,

1627
01:08:28,720 --> 01:08:31,130
if they're not gonna go out and do that,

1628
01:08:31,130 --> 01:08:32,070
stories of winning,

1629
01:08:32,070 --> 01:08:32,920
stories of success,

1630
01:08:32,920 --> 01:08:34,790
and as I talk about history too,

1631
01:08:34,790 --> 01:08:36,230
where places or things have changed

1632
01:08:36,230 --> 01:08:37,650
and let's try to think about how

1633

01:08:37,650 --> 01:08:39,007
and why that change happened,

1634

01:08:39,007 --> 01:08:42,183
and what normal people
can do to make change,

1635

01:08:43,049 --> 01:08:45,153
I did have students tell me there'd

1636

01:08:45,153 --> 01:08:46,960
be totally depressed leaving my class,

1637

01:08:46,960 --> 01:08:49,010
and that's really not the goal
at the end of the semester,

1638

01:08:49,010 --> 01:08:51,140
so having some place to show the ways

1639

01:08:51,140 --> 01:08:52,680
in which actually positive changes

1640

01:08:52,680 --> 01:08:54,573
happen and how do we learn from that.

1641

01:08:55,988 --> 01:08:57,010
- [Victoria] And that pivot
to community knowledge

1642

01:08:57,010 --> 01:08:59,940
and engagement and active relationships

1643

01:08:59,940 --> 01:09:01,670
to social problems if you want support

1644

01:09:01,670 --> 01:09:03,920
from that contact Andrea or I,

1645

01:09:03,920 --> 01:09:08,170

we have a whole set of toolkits
and workshops and resources,

1646

01:09:08,170 --> 01:09:10,071
real funds that can help
you on that pathway,

1647

01:09:10,071 --> 01:09:12,070
this is a massive topic area,

1648

01:09:12,070 --> 01:09:14,418
and I just feel extremely grateful,

1649

01:09:14,418 --> 01:09:19,418
grateful that our university can depend

1650

01:09:19,470 --> 01:09:21,350
upon the incredible
thinking, work, kindness

1651

01:09:21,350 --> 01:09:23,570
and generosity that
shows up in our faculty,

1652

01:09:23,570 --> 01:09:25,997
so can we please get
another round of applause?

1653

01:09:25,997 --> 01:09:28,997
(audience applauds)

1654

01:09:31,544 --> 01:09:32,943
And I know we said on
the flyer that we wanted

1655

01:09:32,943 --> 01:09:36,830
this also to be a space where
we cultivated communication

1656

01:09:36,830 --> 01:09:39,090
without shouting matches so
please don't shout at me,

1657

01:09:39,090 --> 01:09:40,990

but it looks like the food is delayed,

1658

01:09:42,000 --> 01:09:44,930

but hang around with us and
hopefully it will show up,

1659

01:09:44,930 --> 01:09:46,310

and thank you for coming,

1660

01:09:46,310 --> 01:09:48,060

this has been a great conversation.